

From the Editor

Welcome to the 2021 edition of the SATH Yearbook, my first as editor. This edition appears as locked-down teachers across the world are preparing lessons and teaching classes online (and sharing the inevitable frustrations of doing so!). The difficulties encountered in online teaching remind us of the importance of human interaction in teaching, particularly in history where human actions form the raw materials of our study. Despite these difficulties, teachers and pupils have generally managed impressively. There is no doubt that the Covid-19 pandemic has accelerated innovation in e-learning, proving once again that necessity is the mother of invention.

Whatever technological changes the future brings, the ingredients of a good history lesson will never change. At the heart of a good lesson is attention to the child's nascent relationship with the past. A good history lesson helps a child to understand that people in the past were at once very like us, and also very different. A good lesson helps the child to understand his changing world, by helping him grasp that the world has always changed. It helps the child to make judgements about the past, while insisting that those judgments are informed by evidence, and bounded by credibility and humanity. These are timeless values which are reflected in the articles which appear in this edition.

The Yearbook opens with **Cunningham's** exploration of the Jacobite diaspora in the years after the failed rebellions. He charts the experiences of Jacobites across the globe and shows how their contributions were felt in the military, science, commerce, and culture. It is easy to stereotype the past - and the Jacobite period has, perhaps, been especially vulnerable to this – but the sheer diversity of experience presented here reminds us of the dangers of overgeneralising when we speak about the past. Cunningham's paper will be especially useful to colleagues teaching SQA Courses on The Treaty of Union, but it will also be of interest to teachers who wish to explore important concepts like diaspora, migration and identity with their classes. **Marr's** discussion of causes of the Cuban Missile Crisis - and teaching approaches associated with this - will be similarly useful for colleagues delivering SQA courses, but the paper also examines various historical interpretations on the issue. By looking at a wide range of accounts, Marr encourages teachers to explore the causes as being contested and subject to significant historical debate.

Next, we have three contributions from teachers who have taken advantages of the opportunities presented by partnering with external agencies. **Doyle** shares his department's experience of developing a fully integrated social studies curriculum derived from the kinds of 'Big Questions' that children ask about

the 'life, universe and everything'. An ambitious approach to curriculum design, the department is now formally evaluating its impact using a £3500 Curriculum Investigation Grant from the British Educational Research Association. In her paper, **Malcolm** discusses her experience working with the charity 'Remembering Srebrenica Scotland' to develop a unit of work in which children focus on the causes and impacts of a recent act of genocide. Malcolm offers a powerful justification for this topic, and also explains how colleagues can introduce it in their school. **Taylor** discusses an exciting new partnership with the Economic and Social History Society of Scotland to develop educational video materials which can refresh and update the teaching of familiar topics. Taylor argues that an outmoded interpretation of the First World War continues to dominate in schools and suggests that high-quality videos can serve as a corrective to these narratives, and a valuable form of professional updating for colleagues.

The Yearbook closes with two lengthy reflections on how history in Scottish schools could be different. **Mole** focuses on the relative absence of women in the Scottish curriculum and offers a powerful argument for this to be remedied. Although she acknowledges that the work involved diversifying a well-loved curriculum might be daunting, she argues that this drive towards greater inclusivity should be seen as an ongoing project of curriculum renewal and offers some invaluable examples of widely available resources and some fascinating case studies of women who have earned their place in your classroom. For her part, **Philp** uses the disruption caused by the Covid pandemic as an opportunity to reflect on the ways in which history is taught and assessed in Scotland. She argues that the suspension of National Five examinations in 2020 could be used to question the value of this mode of assessment at a more fundamental level. She advocates a school-assessed curriculum in S4 built around a common progression framework derived from research into procedural concepts such as change, causation and evidence.

Although pandemic restrictions made it impossible for the Scottish history community to meet in person, teachers have continued to innovate and to share good practice. This year SATH will be launching the "Red Pen Pals" scheme to encourage schools to share marking and standardisation practises nationwide. SATH are hoping that this scheme will alleviate some of the concerns about ensuring equitable standards whilst also giving teachers an opportunity to share their experiences with new colleagues across the country. If you are interested in signing up please check out the SATH website or our social media pages.

On the subject of getting involved, we are now actively seeking contributions for next year's SATH Yearbook. We traditionally included a mixture of contributions from academic historians and practising teachers – this is a tradition that we are keen to continue. Papers can:

- Explore aspects of history pedagogy (particularly as it relates to the Scottish context).
- Share the outcomes of school-based learning projects, new approaches to curriculum design or similar
- Consider how the history curriculum might be diversified to take account of historically marginalised voices
- Provide up-to-date surveys of research/ historiography on SQA Examination topics

- Introduce interesting local historical case studies which shed a different light on the SQA examination topics

We are keen to encourage first time authors (indeed, many of the contributors to this edition had not written before) so if you have an idea, please do get in touch. You will be fully supported in preparing your contribution from the ideas stage to publication. In all, the contributions to this edition of the Yearbook show that historical education is a thriving field in Scotland. The papers published here show a real diversity of interests and viewpoints but all are united by a love of the past, and a desire to help children develop that love for themselves.

Joe Smith
University of Stirling
Joseph.smith@stir.ac.uk

Please note that opinions expressed in this Yearbook are those of the respective authors and that publication in the Yearbook does not imply support for these opinions by The Editor, The committee of The Scottish Association of History Teachers or any of its members.

Cover: A Turf cigarette card from 1926 issued by Carreras of London. This card depicts 'The Nithsdale Escape', number 19 in a series of 25 'Famous Escapes'. Thanks go to Mr John Nicholls MBE for permitting us to photograph the image of his physical copy.

“Rebels Without a Cause”: The External Jacobite Diasporas, 1688–1788

Calum Cunningham is a Teacher of History, Classical Studies and Latin and a PhD Candidate at The University of Stirling.

In early 1788, a noteworthy convergence occurred involving the dying Prince Charles Edward Stuart and the first penal colony established in Australia. The first Governor of New South Wales, Arthur Phillip, famously disembarked the First Fleet on 18 January at the settlement of Botany Bay with its first group of transported convicts. Whilst reciting his oaths of office, in a gesture that demonstrates the Jacobite movement’s longevity, one of the first included Phillip having to publicly renounce any allegiance to or further the cause of the man called Charles Edward Stuart – otherwise King Charles III or The Young Pretender – in case the new colony became a place of succour for displaced Jacobite sentiment. Although it was the new governor, rather than the convicts, who swore the oath, this anecdote nonetheless provides an example of how the British penal system still accounted for the threat of Jacobitism almost half a century after its suppression at the Battle of Culloden in 1746. Despite that, British ministers continued to be wary of the peril that loyalty to the Stuart prince represented and, ultimately, continued Jacobite sedition from that century-old adherence. Though Arthur Phillip’s colonial administration could not have known it at the time of his oath-taking, Charles Edward died in the final days of January – providing him with a ‘symbolic victory’ even in death (McLynn, 1988, p. 550; Seward, 2019, p. 326).¹ Yet the legacy of Jacobitism continued to live on, including through its widespread external diasporas.

Following the Revolution of 1688, many supporters of King James VII and II were forced to flee the British Isles for more welcoming realms overseas. The predominant area of refuge for émigrés was in and around Continental Europe where Jacobites found that they had much to offer their host communities in all walks of life. Though this is often referred to as the singular Jacobite diaspora, this article aims to demonstrate a range of numerous and diverse external diasporas that encompassed migrations and other movements connected with Jacobitism. In doing so, it provides an up-to-date consideration and succinct survey of their global reach and impact, thereby establishing these diasporas’ relevance to both Scottish and wider diaspora studies.² Consequently, this would also exhibit the presence

¹ The chosen bookended dates represent the so-called ‘Jacobite century’ between the Revolution of 1688 and Charles Edward Stuart’s death at the end of January in 1788.

² Outwith the confines of this article and its focus upon multinational exemplars, there was also the notable existence of an internal diaspora, which was comprised of Jacobites involved in the uprisings and their aftermaths who remained within the borders of the British Isles. For brief surveys on this parallel component, see Szechi, 2019, pp. 225-8; Pittock, 1998, pp. 128-31.

and prevalence of anti-Jacobitism, which is an equally important aspect of these associated movements.³ However, emphasis will be placed here upon both the wide geographical spread of the external Jacobite diasporas and the diverse contributions of their members. Ultimately, the article will provide this important sub-topic greater prominence within the current Scottish History curriculum and aid the teaching practice of Jacobitism more generally.

The dispersal of many Jacobite adherents had a significant effect upon seventeenth- and eighteenth-century societies, and some noteworthy examples of the elite and eminent but also not so well-known Jacobites or Jacobite-connected individuals associated with these diasporas during this period will follow.⁴ Countless suffered the negative consequences of exile whilst others went on to achieve fame and fortune. This article employs an organisational structure demarcated by their respective places of exile across four main geographical areas: Continental Europe, Scandinavia, Russia, and the American colonies. Within this, the types of contributions that these particular characters made to their respective communities will be highlighted. The contribution groupings include those provided to the military; commerce, finance and global enterprising; and science and socio-political culture. Daniel Szechi (2019, p. 223) states ‘there can be no doubt that [a great] deal of talent left the British Isles as a result of the failure of the Jacobite cause, and it served its new European masters well.’ Yet this can also be said of those who fled further afield too.

As Murray Pittock (1998, p. 123) emphasises, it was the expelled royal family themselves who were the most prominent Jacobite exiles. Indeed, James VII and II has been referred to as ‘The First Jacobite’ (Mann, 2014, pp. 11-26). His son, James Francis Edward Stuart, Prince of Wales – otherwise King James VIII and III or The Old Pretender – was born in England but soon after was taken across the Channel to France by his mother under the instructions and ahead of his father. He was thus, arguably, the first official member of the external diasporas. Following the king’s departure, the exiled Catholic Stuarts were known as the ‘Kings over the Water’ and many thousands of their Jacobite followers who upheld their regnal claims joined them in exile (Gregg, 2012, para. 1; Corp, 2007, p. 313). Edward Corp (2007, p. 314) notes that the external diasporas, comprising exiles from various Christian denominations, largely encompassed France, Spain, Russia, Sweden, Portugal, Prussia, and the Italian – mainly Papal – states and ‘in recent years have been accorded increased attention from historians.’ The extensive displacement of these émigrés is, as Bruce Lenman (1980, p. 8) argues, an

³ For recent studies that deal with the theme of anti-Jacobitism, see D. Parrish (2017) *Jacobitism and Anti-Jacobitism in the British Atlantic World, 1688–1727*, London, The Boydell Press; C. Martin (2014) ‘Female Rebels’: The Female Figure in Anti-Jacobite Propaganda’, in A. I. MacInnes, K. German and L. Graham (eds.) *Living with Jacobitism, 1690–1788: The Three Kingdoms and Beyond*, London, Pickering & Chatto (Publishers) Ltd, pp. 85-98.

⁴ Due to the scope of this article, which aims to highlight some notable diasporic Jacobite connections, relationships and reversals of fortune for illuminating case study purposes, the patterns of emigration and migration of the elites were vastly outnumbered by the Jacobite plebeian (or lower class) constituent. Naturally, accounts of their travails are not so well-established and more research in this field is required in the future. For a recent study on popular plebeian Jacobitism during the ‘45, see D. S. Layne, (2015) ‘Spines of the Thistle: The Popular Constituency of the Jacobite Rising in 1745–6’, PhD thesis (The University of St Andrews) <https://research-repository.st-andrews.ac.uk/handle/10023/886> (Accessed 11 September 2020).

intriguing yet neglected aspect of the Jacobite story and these often ‘forgotten and despised communities.’

Being defined as a Jacobite, whether that was self-determined or a smear by their enemies, was but one component of a multifaceted identity. Within Jacobite studies, scholars have tended to paint pictures of individuals’ lives in broad strokes. Yet Jacobitism was compatible with an array of other feelings, ideals, occupations, and morals (Szechi, 2006, p. 57). These assorted factors tell us much about each Jacobite émigré’s philosophical agenda when factored against the immediate practical concerns of their newfound circumstances. Furthermore, as Darren Layne (2015, p. 2) asserts, practical welfare was almost always more vital than an overriding ideological cause, the latter of which often ‘took a backseat to issues of necessity.’⁵

Contributions to the Military

Szechi (2019, p. 222) notes that ‘taken in the round, the Jacobite contribution to their host societies was out of all proportion to their numbers’ and ‘primarily military because that was the only marketable skill most Jacobites possessed, but nonetheless important for that.’ As a result, a key area of both success and failure, and occasionally a combination of the two, was in the martial domain. A notable figure was the Scot, George Keith, tenth Earl Marischal, who took part in the northern component of the Jacobite Uprising of 1715 and followed James Stuart to France in its aftermath. Edward Furgol (2006, para. 3) explains that ‘in 1716, the Hanoverian government attainted Keith for treason and forfeited his estates to the crown; he was one of the few Scots to suffer such a heavy penalty for resisting the new dynasty.’ Keith’s diasporic journey was varied. He returned to Scotland only twice during the rest of his life. He was given joint-command of the Spanish forces in the Uprising of 1719, or the ‘19, which ended in total failure. Badly wounded, he found his way back to Spain (Furgol, 2006, para. 3).⁶

Keith did remain involved in various, yet futile, efforts to restore the exiled Stuarts. Whilst still active at the time of the ‘45, he took no part in its planning or unravelling (Furgol, 2006, para. 4). He enjoyed a successful diplomatic career between the intermittent uprisings and then served the Prussian king, Frederick the Great, as both Ambassador Extraordinary to France and, subsequently, Spain. He was also made Governor of the Prussian Enclave of Neuchâtel (Furgol, 2006, para. 5; Lenman, 1980, p. 9). When Keith returned to Scotland in 1761, ‘diehard Jacobite opinion in the North-east could still regard him as a traitor’ despite his exile of forty-five years. Moreover, it is reported that within a few months he was ‘despised and neglected’ and whether this was due to his ‘chilly welcome’ or to Scotland’s chilly climate, to which he was long unaccustomed, he returned to the Continent to live out his days in Prussian service (Pittock, 1998, pp. 125-6).

⁵ D. Szechi, (2006) *1715: The Great Jacobite Rebellion*, New Haven, CT, and London, Yale University Press, p. 57; Layne, 2015, ‘Spines of the Thistle: The Popular Constituency of the Jacobite Rising in 1745–6’, p. 2. For further works on motivational and wider social components of Jacobitism, see F. J. McLynn, (1982) ‘Issues and Motives in the Jacobite Rising of 1745’, *The Eighteenth Century*, vol. 23, no. 2, pp. 97-133; F. J. McLynn, (1985) ‘The Ideology of Jacobitism on the Eve of the Rising of 1745’, *History of European Ideas*, vol. 6, pp. 1-18; 173-88; M. Pittock, (2006) *The Myth of the Jacobite Clans* (2nd Ed.), Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press Ltd.

⁶ Keith’s co-commander was William Murray, Marquess of Tullibardine, or *titular* second Duke of Atholl, in the Jacobite peerage and elder brother of Lord George Murray, a lieutenant-general of the Jacobite Army during the ‘45 – both were also prominent elite Jacobite exiles. See Lenman, 1980, p. 9.

According to Rebecca Wills (2002, p. 1), Russia is 'arguably one of the most exciting Jacobite destinations' of the external diasporas. Keith's younger brother, James Francis Edward Keith – James Stuart's namesake – was the most well-known Jacobite who entered Russian military service. He served in the Russian Imperial Army and was made Governor of Ukraine. He later joined his brother in the service of Frederick the Great and became a field marshal. However, his illustrious military career came to end when he died in combat at the Battle of Hochkirch in 1758 (Pittock, 1998, p. 125).

Another prominent exemplar was the Anglo-Irishman, James Butler, second Duke of Ormonde. Like George Keith, he was impeached for high treason and other high crimes and misdemeanours and was subsequently attainted and forfeited. Having escaped to France, Ormonde spent much time traversing Europe and beyond on behalf of James Stuart, accumulating high offices and commissions (Szechi, 2019, p. 108). Stuart Handley (2006, para. 16) explains that these included being made captain-general of the exiled Jacobites and subsequently a general in the Spanish Army, where he was to lead an Irish contingent. His accumulated honours serve to stress what could be achieved in exile, though his efforts and career ultimately declined into disappointment. Although he met Charles Edward Stuart just before the prince departed France en route to Scotland, Ormonde's Jacobite prestige and popularity were fading, and he died shortly before the Jacobite Army's victory at the Battle of Prestonpans in 1745. Following the '45, the elderly exiled Jacobite was permitted, in death, a return to British soil for burial close to his grandfather in Westminster Abbey (Ó Ciardha, 2000, p. 193).

A further illustration of elite Jacobite diasporic careerism was that of the Irishman and French-naturalised exile, Colonel Nathaniel Hooke, Jacobite *titular* first Baron Hooke. Hooke became a convert to Catholicism, having initially served James Scott, first Duke of Monmouth, but was pardoned by James VII and II. As a trusted French agent, he secretly visited Scotland twice between 1705 and 1707, 'consulted with various cliques of Jacobites and other potential supporters and took Scottish emissaries with him back to France' (Szechi, 2019, p. 102). This was all done in an attempt to land James Stuart in Scotland, which ultimately failed in the planned invasion of 1708. In that year, he was promoted to brigadier-general in the French Army. Though he took no part in the '15, he was still in favour and in 1718 James Stuart appointed him as his envoy to Prussia. Only a few months before he had also been installed as a Marshal of France – thus accumulating high offices within these external realms (Archbold, 2011, para. 3).⁷

Though elites like Keith and Ormonde attained exalted positions, many fellow Protestant Jacobites, however, continued to face more acute religious predicaments throughout mainland Europe.⁸ Szechi highlights instances in several

⁷ Another French-naturalised, Jacobite-connected exile was Jacques MacDonald, first Duke of Taranto and Marshal of the (French) Empire. Born in France, he was a close relative of Flora MacDonald, as his Jacobite family hailed from Howbeg on South Uist. He ascended so loftily within the French military that he became 'one of Napoleon's most senior commanders and a folk hero in his native Highlands'. Whilst on a visit to Scotland in 1825, MacDonald 'was amazed by the [Jacobite] tactical incompetence implicit in what he saw of Culloden Battlefield.' See Pittock, 1998, p. 127.

⁸ It is still assumed by many that Roman Catholics comprised the largest support base for the Jacobite movement. This was the case in Ireland and, to a lesser extent, in England with Paul Monod, for example, noting that in that kingdom, Catholics 'had a natural attachment to a king of their own faith.' In Scotland, however, the Jacobite composition was dissimilar to the two other traditional Stuart dominions. Lenman explains that whilst the staunchly Catholic Jacobite clans would, naturally, be favourably inclined towards a Catholic monarch and their adherence was all but taken for granted, it was the

Catholic realms of natural or anticipated friction. For example, he points to King Louis XIV's obstinate refusal to allow the first exiled Stuart court at Saint-Germain-en-Laye to entertain Protestant Jacobite church services and the king's forbiddance of the Parisian church authorities to 'allow the[m] a graveyard in which to bury their dead' (Szechi, 2019, p. 221). Conversely, the Papacy was hesitant to instigate the practice of persecution against exiled Protestant Jacobites, particularly after James Stuart sought refuge in the Papal States from 1716, subsequently settling (permanently) in Rome in 1718 and numerous Protestant Jacobites followed their king to Italy (Stanley-Price, 2014, p. 22).

Nicholas Stanley-Price explains that the then Pope, Clement XI, following a request from James's ambassador to the Papal court, 'agreed that any Protestants who died in Rome might be buried on land adjacent to the Pyramid of Gaius Cestius, on the side that lay *inside* the city walls' (Stanley-Price, 2014, p. 22). Stanley-Price adds that a Dr Arthur from Edinburgh was the first to receive a proper and sanctified Protestant Christian burial as a result of Clement's tolerance.⁹ Though Dr Arthur died in 1716, before the exiled court arrived and settled in Rome, 'by 1750 more than a dozen Protestants who were members of the court – and others who were not, such as the Grand Tourists – had died in Rome and had been buried adjacent to the Pyramid' (Stanley-Price, 2014, p. 22).¹⁰ However, this was an uncommon and privileged set of circumstances.

Consequently, Protestant-governed dominions such as the kingdoms of Sweden and Norway became other communal destinations for Protestant Jacobites, particularly Scottish Episcopalians, as alternatives to the Catholic powers of mainland Continental Europe. One notable martial example in this 'region' of the external diasporas was John Mackenzie, Lord Macleod, a Jacobite soldier and heir to the forfeited Cromartie estates, who was taken prisoner the day before Culloden. Mackenzie, who served with distinction in the Swedish Army, returned to Scotland to recover his estates with a Swedish title to boot, which King George III recognised in 1778 – potentially restoring some aspects of legitimacy and respect for the Jacobite Mackenzies of Cromartie. An example amongst many of later military success, he ascended to the rank of lieutenant-general and was awarded the Swedish Royal Order of the Sword (McLeod, 1996, pp. 20-1). Mackenzie's restitution was likely more straightforward, owing to his shared Protestantism with the king and the length of time since the real threat of another uprising had physically diminished.

Episcopalian clergy who provided the vast majority of Jacobite support and conveyed most of the movement's ideologies to their followers. So, when deliberating upon Protestant Jacobitism we are almost always describing Episcopalians in Scotland and High Church Anglicans in England and Wales. See P. K. Monod, (1989) *Jacobitism and the English people, 1688–1788*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, p. 126; B. Lenman, (1982) 'The Scottish Episcopal Clergy and the Ideology of Jacobitism' in E. Cruickshanks (ed.), *Ideology and Conspiracy: Aspects of Jacobitism, 1689–1759*, Edinburgh, John Donald Publishers Ltd, p. 36.

⁹ Due to the timing of his death, it remains unclear as to whether this Dr Arthur was a Jacobite, or even associated with the exiled court.

¹⁰ A similar contrast, though direct in the same Aurelian Walls surrounding Rome, lies in the Roman, and Pagan, insistence that Christians had to be buried *outside* the ancient city walls in the catacombs prior to the Constantinian era. Moreover, the Cimitero Acattolico ('Non-Catholic Cemetery') or Cimitero dei Protestanti ('Protestant Cemetery') is the final resting place of the English poets, John Keats and Percy Bysshe Shelley.

Beyond Europe, in the New World of the American colonies and the Caribbean, there mainly exist records of noteworthy Jacobite-connected individuals and some others who occasionally register in the surviving sources, rather than established diasporic Jacobite communities (Szechi, 2019, p. 223).¹¹ Two prominent military examples were the Scots, Allan Maclean and Hugh Mercer – allies at Culloden and ensuing fugitives from the field of battle – both of whom soared to extraordinary martial heights as brigadier-generals during the American Revolutionary War (1775–83). They latterly found themselves on opposing sides of the Revolution, with Maclean commanding British Army Loyalists and Mercer leading Continental Army (Patriot) forces. Mercer was one of a group of Scots, including some former Jacobite soldiers, who became closely associated with George Washington, first President of the United States, at different stages of Washington's life (Beacock Fryer, 1987, pp. 1; 217; Goolrick, 1906, pp. 1; 59-60).

Contributions to Commerce, Finance and Global Enterprising

It is important to note that the majority of the exiled Jacobites were expelled by force through punishments inflicted upon them by their victorious enemies. This was particularly the case for the lower classes, who often desperately found themselves in need of refuge, prospective new homes and careers (Monod et al., 2010, p. 3). Siobhan Talbot (2014, pp. 110-1) explains that many of the Scottish merchants in France who were sympathetic to Jacobitism were not included in the exodus triggered by the various political upheavals associated specifically with the Jacobite movement, and were already established on the Continent before the Revolution of 1688. Middle- and lower-class exiles would, therefore, have found sympathetic businesses in and around Paris and along the western seaboard of France who traded frequently with the British Isles (Lenman, 1980, p. 10). These exiles would likely have settled at ports such as Dunkirk, Saint-Omer, Boulogne, Dieppe, Le Havre, Rouen, Saint-Malo, Morlaix, Brest, Nantes, Lorient, La Rochelle, and Bordeaux. There were also Jacobite business communities as far as Bilbao, Cádiz, Seville, and Málaga (Pittock, 1998, p. 127).

These communities provided new opportunities for Jacobite exiles who wanted to seize a chance at continuing their previous career or to start afresh. The Franco-Irishman, Antoine Walsh, is one such individual from a family of exiled Jacobites (Lenman, 1980, p. 10). His family, as Szechi (2019, p. 223) highlights, 'made a fortune as privateers-cum-merchants' and typified 'the vigour and aggression which the scattering of Jacobite mercantile dynasties added to the commercial life of France's burgeoning western seaboard towns.' Walsh operated

¹¹ For studies with an emphasis on Jacobitism in a transatlantic context, see F. J. McLynn, (1988) 'Unpopular Front: Jews, Radicals and Americans in the Jacobite World-View', *Royal Stuart Paper*, 31; J. Hawkins, (1996) 'Imperial '45: the Jacobite Rebellion in Transatlantic Context', *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History*, 24, pp. 24-47; G. Plank, (2006) *Rebellion and Savagery: The Jacobite Rising of 1745 and the British Empire*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press; A. I. Macinnes and D. J. Hamilton (eds.) (2014) *Jacobitism, Enlightenment and Empire, 1680–1820*, London, Pickering & Chatto (Publishers) Ltd; A. Murdoch, (2016) 'Two Scottish documents concerning emigration to North Carolina in 1754', *North Carolina Historical Review*, pp. 361-85; N. Martin, (2018) 'The Cultural Paradigms of British Imperialism in the Militarisation of Scotland and North America, c.1745–1775' (unpublished PhD thesis, The University of Stirling), [Online]. Available at <https://dspace.stir.ac.uk/handle/1893/28516#.XKShJC-ZOqA> (Accessed 7 September 2020); K. B. Sherman (2019) 'Thistle Among the Pines: Flora MacDonald and the Highland Scots of the Cape Fear', *Salt Magazine*; K. B. Sherman (2019) 'Emigration as Epidemic: Perspectives on the Eighteenth-century Scottish Highlands,' *Nursing Clio*, February, [Online]. Available at <https://nursingclio.org/2019/02/21/emigration-as-epidemic-perspectives-on-the-eighteenth-century-scottish-highlands/> (Accessed 7 September 2020); and Parrish's *Jacobitism and Anti-Jacobitism*.

out of Nantes and gained wider renown and notoriety, as he was the man who 'conveyed [Charles Edward Stuart] to Scotland in 1745 and organised his rescue in 1746' (Lenman, 1980, p. 10).

Other notable and successful Jacobite exiles in these regions included the bankers, William Gordon and Sons, the brothers George and John Waters, and Aeneas MacDonald, who actively helped modernise the French financial sector. The English former Jacobite soldier and industrialist John Holker 'almost single-handedly created a modern textile industry in France, and was ennobled for his efforts' (Szechi, 2019, p. 223). Aeneas MacDonald, who, as Lenman (1980, p. 10) asserts, was on his way to Scotland anyway nonetheless aided Charles Edward, allegedly reluctantly, as one of the Seven Men of Moidart. Escaping execution following Culloden, he was permitted to return to France and resumed his successful financial career; here he perished during the French Revolution (1789–99).

The Scottish quasi-Jacobite financier and economist, John Law, whose fall from grace is a spectacular example of a Jacobite-connected success story that became a French national scandal (Pittock, 1998, p. 127). Law was compelled to flee Great Britain for France after killing an adversary in a duel in 1694. However, his monetarist brilliance gradually gained the attention of the French royal court. After having spent some time at Saint-Germain-en-Laye, he was commissioned to set up the first major private bank in France in 1716 – *Le Banque Générale Privée*. He was later appointed as the French Controller-General of Finances in 1720. Yet Law's maladroit introduction of new banking methods, such as paper money, futures and margin trading in a country 'unused to and suspicious of them' led to a market collapse and Law was forced to abscond from France and his career effectively nosedived (Bonney, 2009, para. 4; Pittock, 1998, p. 127). Having received a pardon from the British government in 1719, he was permitted to return to British shores and settled in London but was later used by them as a foreign agent to spy on their enemies. He died, impoverished, in Venice. Nevertheless, Law's legacy endured in the form of his first land bank creation, which became the principal prototype for the Banque de France in 1800 (Bonney, 2009, para. 1; Pittock, 1998, p. 127).

Jacobite merchants and traders also thrived in the 'flourishing [Protestant] economy' of wider Scandinavia (McLeod, 1996, p. 20). There were business houses of Scots Jacobite origin in Sweden, primarily at Gothenburg and Malmö, and in the joint Kingdom of Denmark-Norway at both Copenhagen and Bergen. Additionally, other sympathetic communities could be found in the Baltic regions in places such as Danzig and Riga, and a mainly exiled Scots community founded the Swedish East India Company in Gothenburg (Lenman, 1980, p. 9; Szechi, 2019, p. 223). Tax-paying discharged soldiers were encouraged to settle in Swedish towns, and they were joined by political refugees – especially following the '45. Forty-four Scottish Jacobites arrived in Gothenburg between July 1746 and September 1747 and a particularly sizeable number of Britons, mainly Scots, provided sanctuary for many fleeing Jacobites (McLeod, 1996, pp. 20-1; Behre, 1991, p. 58).

A pertinent success story was Thomas Erskine, a member of a Jacobite-supporting family from Fife and later a very successful businessman. Erskine was

born in 1746 – the same year of the final Jacobite defeat at Culloden. Furthermore, his Jacobite family's estate in Cambo, Fife was forfeited shortly afterwards. Disinherited and seeking his fortune elsewhere, he willingly emigrated at the age of thirteen and began his career in the shipping firm of George Carnegie, also a Scottish Jacobite exile, in Gothenburg. This continued to be a common thread amongst émigrés of the external diasporas after the '45, as with the previous uprisings. Carnegie had fought against his elder brother, James, a British soldier during the '45 – this exemplifies that a significant facet of the Jacobite conflicts was rooted in a British civil war.¹² Within a few years, Erskine was the partner in another firm and 'by 1794 had his own company trading in iron, timber, tea, and [East Asian] luxuries with Scotland, Canton, India, and the USA' (McLeod, 1996, pp. 20-1; Berg and Lagercrantz, no date, paras. 15-7; 23). Like other diasporic Jacobites or their descendants, Erskine had a strong desire to reclaim what was taken from his family. He eventually inherited the title, the ninth earl of Kellie and bought back Cambo House, but was unable to retrieve the accompanying estates. Around 1800, he returned to his native homeland of Scotland to live out his remaining days (McLeod, 1996, pp. 20-1; Berg and Lagercrantz, no date, para. 23).

Two further commercial success stories emanating from the New World were Sir John Wedderburn of Ballindean, sixth Baronet of Blackness, and James Stirling. The former became an extremely successful sugar merchant, plantation owner, slave trader, and substantial landowner in Jamaica who reclaimed his father's Scottish title. The latter paid off the debts of his forfeited estates through his offspring, who became widely spread across successful global business ventures. The seventeen-year-old Wedderburn joined his father, who was a Perthshire laird and colonel in the Jacobite Army during the '45, and both were present at Culloden serving in Lord Ogilvy's regiment. John's father, also John, fifth Baronet of Blackness, was captured after the battle but his son escaped. Finding his way to London aboard a Leith trading vessel and under the protection of a relative once there, the younger Wedderburn is said to have possibly met his father one final time at Southwark gaol before his brutal execution by hanging, drawing, and quartering on 28 November 1746 (Wedge et al., no date, para. 1; Wedderburn, 1898, p. 288; Macinnes, 2014, pp. 123-9).

Following the execution, Wedderburn then fled the British Isles onboard a ship bound for the American colonies, labouring for his passage. Following the *Indemnity Act* of 1747 in June of that year, he proceeded to the Caribbean and settled in Jamaica. After initially working as a doctor, despite having no qualifications, he turned to the sugar trade and made his fortune as a plantation and slave owner – raising a fortune for his family and acquiring considerable property on the island. Later in life, long after the martial Jacobite threat was over and following a hard-fought campaign, he won back his attained father's title. In 1763, he returned to Scotland in an attempt to also restore the forfeited

¹² Like numerous other Jacobite exiles, Carnegie returned to Scotland. Before his return in 1769, he had repurchased his ancestral family seat of Pittarrow and Charleton, another estate, both in Southesk, near Montrose. Indeed, it was from Montrose, in flight from Culloden, that he and two fellow Jacobites escaped on an open boat before being picked up by a Swedish vessel, which took them to safety in Gothenburg. See J. Berg and B. Lagercrantz, (no date) 'Scots in Sweden – Eighteenth Century', *Electric Scotland*, [Online]. Available at <https://electricScotland.com/history/sweden/18.htm> (Accessed 26 September 2020).

Wedderburn estates. Returning to Jamaica in 1766 to oversee his commercial ventures, he again departed for Scotland in 1768 and remained there for the rest of his life. He soon after completed the repurchase of Ballindean, Perthshire. Reversing his family's attainder and forfeiture was, again, likely an attempt to restore his family's former status and respectability. To further demonstrate such a reversal of fortune that the external diasporas could provide, during his lifetime Wedderburn became one of the wealthiest men in the Caribbean and the largest landowner in Jamaica – his amassed wealth allowing him the privileges of his reclamations (Wedge et al., no date, para. 1; Wedderburn, 1898, p. 288).

Similarly, James Stirling, a committed Jacobite in 1708, 1715 and 1745, was attainted and his estates were forfeited following the '15 but were able to be reclaimed, in part, by the mercantile achievements of four of his sons, John, Archibald, James, and Robert – all of whom went on to multinational commercial and financial success (Macinnes, 2014, p. 138). Capital generated from the American colonies and plantations in Jamaica producing sugar and rum, 'stamp trading, silks and other textiles, minerals, sugar candy, spirits, Chinaware and opium' made the Stirlings very wealthy. Moreover, their business endeavours involved further proto-imperial realms, such as Calcutta, Patna, Madras and Bengal. However, not all Jacobite exiles or émigrés were so successful. Allan Macinnes (2014, p. 138) provides examples of some Jacobite families, such as the Threiplands of Gask in West Africa and India, the Balfours of Burleigh in the African slave trade, and the Mackintoshes of Borlum in the Caribbean – all of whom failed to remunerate their estates with the wealth of imperial empire.¹³

Contributions to Science and Socio-political Culture

A significant member of the external diasporas was the prominent mathematician, James Stirling (no immediate relation to the former). He hailed from a staunchly Jacobite Stirlingshire family. His father had been charged with high treason around 1709 but was later acquitted (O'Connor and Robertson, 1998, para. 2). Stirling was admitted to study at Balliol College as a Nonjuring Episcopalian student, but he was forced to withdraw upon refusing to swear the oaths of allegiance to both Queen Anne and King George I (Tweddle, 2004, para. 1). Without graduating, in the aftermath of the '15 Stirling travelled to Venice to continue his mathematical research and thereafter became known as 'The Venetian'. He returned to Great Britain around 1725 and spent time in Glasgow before settling in London for the next ten years (Tweddle, 2004, para. 1; O'Connor and Robertson, 1998, paras. 3-5). There he regularly corresponded with many of the leading scientists and mathematicians of the day and struck up a longstanding friendship with Sir Isaac Newton. It was Newton who sponsored Stirling for a fellowship in the Royal Society of London and on 3 November 1726 Stirling was elected. In 1730, Stirling published his most important work, *Methodus Differentialis*, which was 'a treatise on infinite series, summation, interpolation and quadrature' (O'Connor and Robertson, 1998, para. 13; summary). However, in

¹³ For an illustration of further relevant examples dealing with Jacobite-connected commercial activity on a global scale, see A. I. Macinnes, K. German and L. Graham (eds.) (2014) *Living with Jacobitism, 1690–1788: The Three Kingdoms and Beyond*, London, Pickering & Chatto (Publishers) Ltd; S. Murdoch, (2006) *Network North: Scottish Kin, Commercial and Covert Association in Northern Europe, 1603–1746*, Leiden, Brill.

1745, due to his lingering Jacobite sympathies, he was refused a chair at the University of Edinburgh (O'Connor and Robertson, 1998, para. 23; Tweddle, 2004, para. 8). Stirling proves to be an interesting case of acceptance and rejection due in part to his Jacobite connections.

Many prominent scholars have rightly stressed that women were Jacobites too and that the integration of a more appropriate female perspective into Jacobite historiography is essential without simply seeing the 'heroine' (Martin, 2014, p. 41).¹⁴ Within an external Jacobite diasporic context, the assimilation and experiences of numerous Scottish noblewomen provide an important facet of the broader integration of Jacobite exiles in Europe. Notable examples include Lady Margaret Maule (*née* Hamilton), Countess of Panmure, and Lady Marjory Hay (*née* Murray), Jacobite *titular* Duchess of Inverness. Lady Winifred Maxwell courageously participated in Jacobite-related affairs through the rescue of her imprisoned husband, Lord William Maxwell, fifth Earl of Nithsdale, from the Tower of London in 1716. Attainted and forfeited they escaped to the Continent, but their lives saw a reversal of fortune as they eventually found themselves at the exiled Stuart court in Rome. Succeeding the Jacobite *titular* Duke and Duchess of Inverness, the Hays, Lord and Lady Nithsdale were respectively appointed governor and governess to the young Prince Henry Benedict Stuart – otherwise King Henry I and IX or The Cardinal Duke of York – by his father, James Stuart. This provided the young Stuart prince with a strong Scottish – and Catholic – cultural presence from an early age (Maxwell Stuart, 1995, p. 149; Bogle, 2006, pp. 1-4).¹⁵

Another notable Jacobite exile who contributed in some small part to American socio-political culture was the Scot, George Home (or Hume), second son of the forfeited laird, Sir George Home, tenth Baronet of Wedderburn. He was captured after the Battle of Preston in 1715 and was incarcerated in the Marshalsea prison. He was not transported as punishment but rather voluntarily travelled to Virginia in 1721, where he settled amongst a small community of fellow Jacobite exiles. His four younger brothers all became officers in the Royal Navy, but this was not an option for him as a convicted Jacobite.¹⁶ Through family connections, he was appointed Surveyor of Spotsylvania County in 1728 and his surveys are referenced in every county of the colony during this period. He became associated with Peter Jefferson, also a county surveyor, and who would become the father of Thomas, third President of the United States (Erskine Hume, 1931,

¹⁴ For other important studies focussing upon female Jacobitism, see M. Craig, (1997) *Damn' Rebel Bitches: The Women of the '45*, Edinburgh, Mainstream Publishing Company (Edinburgh) Ltd; M. Craig, (2002) 'The Fair Sex Turns Ugly: Female Involvement in the Jacobite Rising of 1745', in Y. G. Brown and R. Ferguson (eds.) *Twisted Sisters: Women, Crime and Deviance in Scotland since 1400*, East Linton, Tuckwell Press Ltd, pp. 84-100.

¹⁵ Arguably, the most famous of these women of renown, Flora MacDonald, was also a member of a Scottish Highland diasporic community in North Carolina for a time before returning to her native Scotland. See H. Douglas, (1993) *Flora MacDonald: The Most Loyal Rebel*, Stroud, Alan Sutton Publishing Ltd, p. 138.

¹⁶ We know that by the '45, more than a few Jacobites of note eventually became officers in the British Army, providing a juxtaposition of the aftermaths of the major Uprisings of 1715 and 1745. Alongside Allan Maclean, another prominent example was Simon Fraser, Master of Lovat. The eldest son of the executed Jacobite, Simon Fraser, eleventh Lord Lovat, and a serving Jacobite, he became a major-general for the British during the Seven Years' War (1756–63) and led many of his clansmen to war for the Hanoverian dynasty. See Szechi, 2019, p. 227; Pittock, 1998, p. 127; Plank, *Rebellion and Savagery*, pp. 75-6; 179-80.

pp. 9-127; 1939, pp. 13-90). Yet perhaps his most illustrious acquaintanceship was with a young George Washington. Whilst Home was surveyor of Spotsylvania, Washington was appointed to a junior surveyorship of the newly made county of Culpeper and learned his craft from the elder George before he commenced his military and political careers. There exists from the county of Frederick and others several surveys that they made together, with the records signed 'George Hume, Surveyor; George Washington, Assistant Surveyor' (Erskine Hume, 1931, pp. 76-7; 1939, pp. 87-90).

Conclusion

In conclusion, this article has stressed the extensive dispersal of numerous Jacobites across the globe. It has provided germane exemplars that demonstrate the diversity of diasporic livelihoods awaiting them after varying failures during the Jacobite uprisings, but also the variety of contributions that they made to their new homes and the communities in which they participated. Across the Jacobite century and beyond, the most common international termini for many Jacobites have been surveyed, whether that be a Catholic destined for France or a Protestant bound for Sweden. However, it is important to re-emphasise that Jacobite adherence was not primarily dictated by religious affiliation and a range of factors determined respective destinations and outcomes for countless Jacobites.

Yet within these customary confines, the intention has been to reveal the complex individual journeys and the array of aspects that shaped each Jacobite émigré or exile's circumstances in the years following their dispersion. Though each individual had his or her reasons and agendas for being connected with the Jacobite movement and its ideologies, for many their association was distinctly personal with specific aims but was also governed by a multitude of novel issues often including matters of survival. These issues could frequently be exacerbated by their scattering to different climes and what conditions they found themselves in upon arrival and over time.

Consequently, with their common cause lost, the external Jacobite diasporas offered a chance for ostracised participants to reinvent themselves. The lives of these characters display wide mobility of status, from criminality to military honour to destitution and back again – sometimes all in the life of a single person. Whether formal accolades, a new career path or an innovative way to subsist, possibly leaving their Jacobite loyalties or sympathies behind – or kept hidden – to reclaim their family's former possessions, the assortment of successes and failures provides a view into various diasporic case studies to supplement pertinent senior phase History topics – particularly the Advanced Higher course. Ultimately, these external Jacobite diasporas are a significant topic within Scottish, British and wider international history. Over and above the traditional places of refuge, mainly in and around Continental Europe, Jacobite-connected activity, often with a heavy Scottish influence, can be emphasised from America to Australia and Norway to Africa, thus accentuating its truly global reach and impact.

References

- Archbold, W. A. J., revised by Glozier, M. R. (2011) 'Hooke, Nathaniel, Jacobite first Baron Hooke (1664–1738)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 19 May, [Online]. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/13691> (Accessed 26 August 2020).
- Beacock Fryer, M. (1987) *Allan Maclean, Jacobite General: The Life of an Eighteenth-Century Career Soldier*, Toronto and Oxford, Dundurn Press.
- Behre, G. (1991) 'Jacobite Refugees in Gothenburg after Culloden', *Scottish Historical Review*, vol. 70, pp. 58-65.
- Berg, J. and Lagercrantz, B. (no date) 'Scots in Sweden – Eighteenth Century', *Electric Scotland*, [Online]. Available at <https://electricscotland.com/history/sweden/18.htm> (Accessed 26 September 2020).
- Bogle, J. (2006) 'Lord Nithsdale's escape: a Catholic cavalier at Preston and After', *Royal Stuart Paper*, 70.
- Bonney, R. (2006) 'Law, John (bap. 1671, d. 1729)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 8 October, [Online]. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/16150> (Accessed 27 September 2020).
- Corp, E. (2007) 'From the Court to the Colonies: Jacobites over the Water', 1650–1850: *Ideas, Aesthetics, and Inquiries in the Early Modern Era. Special Feature – Jacobite Travellers and Fellow-Travellers*, vol. 14, pp. 313-31.
- Craig, M. (1997) *Damn' Rebel Bitches: The Women of the '45*, Edinburgh, Mainstream Publishing Company (Edinburgh) Ltd.
- Craig, M. (2002) 'The Fair Sex Turns Ugly: Female Involvement in the Jacobite Rising of 1745', in Brown, Y. G. and Ferguson, R. (eds.) *Twisted Sisters: Women, Crime and Deviance in Scotland since 1400*, East Linton, Tuckwell Press Ltd, pp. 84-100.
- Douglas, H. (1993) *Flora MacDonald: The Most Loyal Rebel*, Stroud, Alan Sutton Publishing Ltd.
- Furgol, E. M. (2006) 'Keith, George, styled tenth Earl Marischal (1692/3?–1778)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, May, [Online]. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/15265> (Accessed 28 August 2020).
- Goolrick, J. T. (1906) *The Life of General Hugh Mercer. With brief sketches of General George Washington, John Paul Jones, General George Weedon, James Monroe and Mrs. Mary ... of General Mercer at Fredericksburg*, New York, NY, and Washington, DC, The Neale Publishing Company.
- Gregg, E. (2012) 'James Francis Edward [James Francis Edward Stuart; styled James; known as Chevalier de St George, the Pretender, the Old Pretender] (1688–1766)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 24 May, [Online]. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/14594> (Accessed 26 September 2020).
- Handley, S. (2006) 'Butler, James, second duke of Ormond[e] (1665–1745)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, May, [Online]. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/4193> (Accessed 27 August 2020).
- Hawkins, J. (1996) 'Imperial '45: the Jacobite Rebellion in Transatlantic Context', *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History*, 24, pp. 24-47.
- Hume, E. E. (1931) *A Colonial Scottish Jacobite Family: The Establishment in Virginia of a Branch of the Humes of Wedderburn*, Richmond, VA, Old Dominion Press.
- Hume, E. E. (1939) 'Memorial to George Hume, Esquire, Crown Surveyor of Virginia and Washington's Teacher of Surveying, with Notes on His Life', *Tyler's Quarterly Historical and Genealogical Magazine*, vol. 21, no. 3, pp. 6-53.
- Layne, D. S. (2015) 'Spines of the Thistle: The Popular Constituency of the Jacobite Rising in 1745–6' (PhD thesis, The University of St Andrews) <https://research-repository.st-andrews.ac.uk/handle/10023/886> (Accessed 11 September 2020).
- Lenman, B. (1980) 'The Jacobite Diaspora 1688–1746: From Despair to Integration', *History Today*, vol. 30, no. 5.

- Lenman, B. (1982) 'The Scottish Episcopal Clergy and the Ideology of Jacobitism' in Cruickshanks, E. (ed.), *Ideology and Conspiracy: Aspects of Jacobitism, 1689–1759*, Edinburgh, John Donald Publishers Ltd, pp. 36-48.
- Macinnes, A. I. (2014) 'Union, Empire and Global Adventuring with a Jacobite Twist', in Macinnes, A. I. and Hamilton, D. J. (eds.) *Jacobitism, Enlightenment and Empire, 1680–1820*, London, Pickering & Chatto (Publishers) Ltd, pp. 123-39.
- Macinnes, A. I. and Hamilton, D. J. (eds.) (2014) *Jacobitism, Enlightenment and Empire, 1680–1820*, London, Pickering & Chatto (Publishers) Ltd.
- Macinnes, A. I., German, K. and Graham, L. (eds.) (2014) *Living with Jacobitism, 1690–1788: The Three Kingdoms and Beyond*, London, Pickering & Chatto (Publishers) Ltd.
- Mann, A. J. (2014) 'The First Jacobite and the Scottish Parliament', in Macinnes, A. I., German, K. and Graham, L. (eds.) *Living with Jacobitism, 1690–1788: The Three Kingdoms and Beyond*, London, Pickering & Chatto (Publishers) Ltd, pp. 11-26.
- Martin, C. (2014) 'Female Rebels': The Female Figure in Anti-Jacobite Propaganda', in Macinnes, A. I., German, K. and Graham, L. (eds.) *Living with Jacobitism, 1690–1788: The Three Kingdoms and Beyond*, London, Pickering & Chatto (Publishers) Ltd, pp. 85-98.
- Martin, N. (2018) 'The Cultural Paradigms of British Imperialism in the Militarisation of Scotland and North America, c.1745–1775' (unpublished PhD thesis, The University of Stirling), [Online]. Available at <https://dspace.stir.ac.uk/handle/1893/28516#.XKShJC-ZOqA> (Accessed 7 September 2020).
- Maxwell Stuart, F. (1995) *Lady Nithsdale and the Jacobites*, Innerleithen, Traquair House Press.
- McLeod, M. (1996) *Leaving Scotland*, Edinburgh, National Museums of Scotland.
- McLynn, F. J. (1982) 'Issues and Motives in the Jacobite Rising of 1745', *The Eighteenth Century*, vol. 23, no. 2, pp. 97-133.
- McLynn, F. J. (1985) 'The Ideology of Jacobitism on the Eve of the Rising of 1745', *History of European Ideas*, vol. 6, pp. 1-18; 173-88.
- McLynn, F. J. (1988) *Charles Edward Stuart: A Tragedy in Many Acts*, London, Routledge.
- McLynn, F. J. (1988) 'Unpopular Front: Jews, Radicals and Americans in the Jacobite World-View', *Royal Stuart Paper*, 31.
- Monod, P. K. (1989) *Jacobitism and the English people, 1688–1788*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.
- Monod, P., Pittock, M. and Szechi, D. (2010) 'Introduction: Loyalty and Identity', in Monod, P., Pittock, M. and Szechi, D. (eds.) *Loyalty and Identity: Jacobites at Home and Abroad*, Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 1-8.
- Murdoch, A. (2016) 'Two Scottish documents concerning emigration to North Carolina in 1754', *North Carolina Historical Review*, pp. 361-85.
- Murdoch, S. (2006) *Network North: Scottish Kin, Commercial and Covert Association in Northern Europe, 1603–1746*, Leiden, Brill.
- Ó Ciardha, É. (2000) 'The Unkind Deserter' and 'The Bright Duke': contrasting views of the Dukes of Ormonde in the Irish royalist tradition', in Barnard, T. and Fenlon, J. (eds.) *The Dukes of Ormonde, 1610–1745*, Woodbridge, Boydell Press, pp. 177-93.
- O'Connor, J. J. and Robertson, E. F. (1998) 'James Stirling', *MacTutor History of Mathematics Archive*, September, [Online]. Available at <https://mathshistory.st-andrews.ac.uk/Biographies/Stirling/> (Accessed 31 August 2020).
- Parrish, D. (2017) *Jacobitism and Anti-Jacobitism in the British Atlantic World, 1688–1727*, London, The Boydell Press.
- Pittock, M. (2006) *The Myth of the Jacobite Clans* (2nd Ed.), Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press Ltd.
- Pittock, M. G. H. (1998) *Jacobitism*, Basingstoke, Macmillan Press Ltd.
- Plank, G. (2006) *Rebellion and Savagery: The Jacobite Rising of 1745 and the British Empire*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Seward, D. (2019) *The King Over the Water: A Complete History of the Jacobites*, Edinburgh, Birlinn Ltd.

- Sherman, K. B. (2019) 'Thistle Among the Pines: Flora MacDonald and the Highland Scots of the Cape Fear,' *Salt Magazine*.
- Sherman, K. B. (2019) 'Emigration as Epidemic: Perspectives on the Eighteenth-century Scottish Highlands,' *Nursing Clio*, February, [Online]. Available at <https://nursingclio.org/2019/02/21/emigration-as-epidemic-perspectives-on-the-eighteenth-century-scottish-highlands/> (Accessed 7 September 2020).
- Stanley-Price, N. (2014) *The Non-Catholic Cemetery in Rome: Its History, its People and its Survival for 300 Years*, Rome, The Non-Catholic Cemetery in Rome.
- Szechi, D. (2006) *1715: The Great Jacobite Rebellion*, New Haven, CT, and London, Yale University Press.
- Szechi, D. (2019) *The Jacobites: Britain and Europe 1688–1788* (2nd Ed.), Manchester, Manchester University Press.
- Talbot, S. (2014) 'Commerce and the Jacobite Court: Scottish Migrants in France, 1688–1718', in Macinnes, A. I., German, K. and Graham, L. (eds.) *Living with Jacobitism, 1690–1788: The Three Kingdoms and Beyond*, London, Pickering & Chatto (Publishers) Ltd, pp. 99-110.
- Tweddle, I. (2004) 'Stirling, James (1692–1770)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 23 September, [Online]. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/26530> (Accessed 31 August 2020).
- Wedderburn, A. (1898) *The Wedderburn Book; A History of the Wedderburns in the Counties of Berwick and Forfar, Designed of Wedderburn, Kingennie, Easter Powrie, Blackness, Balindean, and Gosford; and their Younger Branches; Together with Some Account of Other Families of the Name, 1296–1896: Part. III., The Wedderburns of Blackness and their Younger Lines*, Printed for private circulation.
- Wedge, R. and other contributors (no date) 'John Wedderburn of Balindean – Profile & Legacies Summary, 1729 – 13 Jun 1803', *Legacies of British Slave-ownership database*, [Online]. Available at <http://www.depts-live.ucl.ac.uk/lbs/person/view/2146634306> (Accessed 27 September 2020).
- Wills, R. (2002) *The Jacobites in Russia, 1715–1750*, East Linton, Tuckwell Press.

Using academic history in the classroom: Causes of the Cuban Missile Crisis

Matthew Marr is a History Teacher at St Joseph's Academy in Kilmarnock

If the Big Bang created the universe - eventually leading to life on Earth - then a big bang in 1962 threatened to end it. The Cuban Missile Crisis brought the world near to nuclear Armageddon, as the USA and Soviet Union came close to a devastating conflict. Just as the origins of the Big Bang are contested, so too is there is historical debate about the causes of the Cuban Crisis. Such a question forms part of the Higher History Cold War course and is also examined at National 5 level.

This article examines potential teaching activities which allow pupils to investigate the cause of the crisis, as well as outlining different historical opinions on this issue.

Teaching approaches

There are different activities in which pupils can engage to give them a better understanding of the events, including possible causes.

1. One useful task is the development of a timeline. Pupils can be given a list of key events from before and during the crisis, and then research each of these. This information can be used to design a timeline, including a description of events and also (for those before the beginning of the crisis) featuring discussion of why this might have caused the crisis. Relevant events from before the crisis might include the 1959 Cuban Revolution and the building of the Berlin Wall.
2. The historian quotes included in this article can also be used to provoke discussion and understanding amongst pupils. For instance, one approach would be to give a quotation from each of the possible causes listed in the article. Pupils could then undertake a research task to identify evidence which supports and/or opposes this point of view.
3. A similar task could be used develop pupil skills in historiographical research. Pupils could again be provided with a quote(s) and then asked to read other historians' work to identify supporting or counter arguments. Both these tasks will enhance pupils' understanding of events, and can also be used as part of assignment research.
4. After the tasks above, pupils could participate in a 'Triangle' discussion of events, developing their evaluation skills. This would involve pupils considering all possible causes, along with historian views and other research. They should complete the triangle by ranking the causes in order of importance, making a decision about which factors were most and least important, and why this is the case.

Cuban Missile Crisis – background and context

Following the 1959 Cuban Revolution, Cuba eventually became a Communist state, led by Fidel Castro. Having an ideological opponent so close to home caused outrage in the USA, leading to American attempts to kill Castro. This pushed the Cubans into a relationship with the Soviets.

In October 1962, an American U-2 spy plane took photographs of weapons sites in Cuba. Analysis of the images showed that the unthinkable – for the United States – had happened; the Soviet Union had placed nuclear missiles in Cuba. What followed was a near fortnight of nuclear brinkmanship. The USA demanded that the Soviets remove the weapons and imposed a naval ‘quarantine’ (essentially a blockade) of Cuba. The USSR refused to bow to this pressure, although secret negotiations were taking place between both sides.

At points each country came close to giving the order for a nuclear ‘first strike’, something which had hitherto seemed impossible. Later accounts suggest such an instruction was only minutes away from happening. This followed provocations such as the shooting down of a US spy plane, and the American navy dropping depth charges on Soviet submarines.

As the world watched with horror, events came to a swift – and peaceful – conclusion. Following behind-the-scenes discussions, the Soviets agreed to remove the Cuban weapons. The USA committed to do likewise with their nuclear missile sites in Turkey and Italy, although this deal was not made public at the time. Further détente agreements were later reached.

Possible Cause One: Soviet actions as a response to strategic missile inferiority

Given that the crisis almost became a nuclear disaster, it is pertinent to consider as a cause the impact of the arms race. This was a key feature of the Cold War; indeed, just one year before Cuba events (October 1961) the Soviets detonated the world’s largest nuclear weapon, the Tsar Bomba. This explosion however hid a simple reality; the USA was well ahead of the Soviet Union in nuclear capability, with some estimates suggesting ‘the US had a nine-to-one advantage in deliverable nuclear weapons’ (de Groot, 2005). More importantly, the Soviet Union knew this, despite leader Nikita Khrushchev’s false boasts that they were turning out missiles ‘like sausage’.

In his book, *The Bomb* Gerard de Groot argues in that eradicating this military gap was a primary influence on Soviet actions. He sees the Soviet strategy of placing weapons as a ‘quick-fix solution to a severe strategic imbalance’ which would be relatively inexpensive, in a financial sense at least, which was important given domestic spending pressures. He says that the Cuban missiles were ‘a quick and easy answer to the strategic imbalance – deterrence on the cheap’ (de Groot, 2005). Furthermore, in the words of J. P. D. Dunbabin in *The Cold War: the great powers and their allies*, ‘It seems most likely that Khrushchev found the opportunity to improve his strategic position vis-à-vis the USA irresistibly attractive’.

These are sentiments echoed by Martin Walker in *The Cold War*. He states that the Soviet military were alarmed by a growth in US weapons spending, and worried that this huge military advantage would be used to take control of areas of Soviet influence. Since the USSR had limited ability to launch ICBMs from its own soil, the placing of cheaper medium range weapons in Cuba made it possible for the USSR to present an immediate credible threat. The Soviets believed that even

if the US had more weapons, the fact Russia could devastate large areas of the United States would remove any American advantage.

Khrushchev's second motive was to create a nuclear balance.... It would take almost a decade to establish parity in ICBMs; but parity could be achieved overnight through the back door, by installing medium-range missiles in Cuba. (Walker, 1994)

David Hoffman goes further in his 2011 book, *The Dead Hand*, when he writes,

The Soviet Union, looking through an entirely different prism from the United States, saw nuclear weapons as a blunt instrument for deterrence. If attacked, they would respond with crushing punishment.

Perhaps most tellingly of all, achieving a form of parity in terms of a nuclear threat is what Nikita Khrushchev himself claims influenced him. In his autobiography, the former Soviet leader stated that:

The Americans had surrounded our country with military bases and threatened us with nuclear weapons and now they would learn just what it feels like to have enemy missiles pointing at you. (Khrushchev, 1970)

Possible Cause Two: Soviet actions as an attempt to spread communism

The Cuban revolution sparked fear across the USA that this would lead to similar events across the Americas, leaving the United States encircled by its enemies. According to Mark White, the US administration worried that events in Cuba could only inspire other communist movements:

Not only did Kennedy and his advisors conceptualise Cuba in terms of a monolithic view of communism, they also placed the country in the context of the domino theory. Time and again, they argued that the continuation of the Castro government would lead to a series of leftist revolutions throughout Latin America (White, 1995)

It is not too strong to say that Fidel Castro and his government were hated in the United States, especially by the two Kennedy brothers, John (President) and Bobby (US Attorney General). So desperate were they to see the end of Castro that they were prepared to enlist the help of the Mafia (Schlosser, 2014), even as publicly Bobby was trying to shut down the Cosa Nostra's activities.

America wanted to rid itself of a neighbouring Red Menace, and over the years contrived many elaborate attempts to remove the Cuban leader. Most famous was the failed Bay of Pigs invasion in 1961, an American-backed coup which failed and brought humiliation onto the new president. Michael Burleigh highlights the central role this played in the brewing of the crisis. He writes that the Kennedys became obsessed with removing Castro, and in doing so created the conditions which would force Cuba to seek Soviet protection:

[Castro became] the target of a highly personal vendetta pursued by the Kennedy brothers for making them lose face at the Bay of Pigs. As a result of this they would pursue Castro with a vengeance, up to and including repeated conspiracies to murder him, and when he and his Soviet patrons went to the brink of war they would match them move for move during the most deadly moment of the entire Cold War. (Burleigh, 2013)

American attempts to isolate Cuba threatened economic disaster for the island, so the USSR's commitment to instead buy Cuban sugar was desperately needed by Castro's government. With Cuba's communist revolution under threat from America, the Soviets then acted to support their new partners.

John Lewis Gaddis – using materials from Soviet archives released years after the crisis – claims that defending Castro's government was in fact the main priority for Khrushchev's government. This was in the belief that Cuba's revolution could be used to inspire similar revolts across South America. The USSR was hugely excited by Cuba's revolution, which they saw as a spontaneous communist uprising brought about without outside interference, an action they hoped to see repeated elsewhere. However, they worried that the USA would eventually succeed in removing Castro from power, ending these dreams. Gaddis says:

Khrushchev intended his missile deployment chiefly as an effort, improbable though it may seem, to spread revolution throughout South America (Gaddis, 2005)

According to Gaddis' book, *The Cold War*, Khrushchev's own private papers say:

We had to think up some way of confronting America with more than words. We had to establish that a tangible and effective deterrent to American interference in the Caribbean. But what exactly? The logical answer was missiles. (Gaddis, 2005)

Gaddis himself concludes that:

Khrushchev allowed his ideological romanticism to overrun whatever capacity he had for strategic analysis. He was so emotionally committed to the Castro revolution that he risked his own revolution, his country and possibly the world on his behalf. (Gaddis, 2005)

Robert Dallek, a US historian who specialises in presidential chronicles, sees additional motivations connected to Castro's revolution. For Dallek, the Soviet Union had concerns about China's growing influence, and worried for Russia's position as the world's primary communist state. Following the Cuban revolution – which occurred without any Soviet inspiration – there was an imperative for the Soviets to involve themselves in this process:

Khrushchev felt that Castro's support of subversion would eventually persuade Kennedy to act against him. In addition, concern that Castro was moving closer to communist China gave Khrushchev another reason to strengthen Soviet-Cuban

links. To do this, he decided to turn Cuba into a missile basis from which he could more directly threaten the United States. (Dallek, 2004)

This is a theme further developed by Michael Burleigh when he says that the Soviets felt they had to work with Cuba, in the hope of bringing about Karl Marx's vision of world revolution:

Khrushchev decided that the USSR should ride the doctrinally unpredicted wave or else be left behind in what could well be the Marxist-Leninist dream of world revolution. To do so involved co-opting the Cubans, who had won enormous prestige by defeating the Americans, in order to halt their drift towards the perfidious Chinese and to curb the Castro-Guevara combine's pretensions to becoming an autonomous ideological force in their own right. (Burleigh, 2013)

Possible Cause Three: Soviet Actions as a response to US Foreign Policy

In order to analyse the extent to which US foreign policy influenced events in Cuba, it is important to understand actions America had taken which might drive the Soviets to risk an annihilatory war. American military manoeuvres in Europe form part of this equation. The US had a notable military presence across Europe. Not only did they have soldiers based in West Berlin (something the Soviets particularly hated), they also had their own nuclear Jupiter missiles in Italy and Turkey.

The fact that the USA had its own presence in Europe whilst simultaneously denying the same right to the Soviets perplexed Khrushchev. de Groot states that:

Khrushchev could not understand why the US assumed the right to place missiles in Turkey and Western Europe but would not allow the Soviets to place missiles in Cuba (de Groot, 2005)

This is a point echoed by other historians who identify Soviet anger at US hypocrisy as an inducement to Cuban events. According to Alex von Tunzelmann in his book *Red Heat*:

Khrushchev told a visiting member of Kennedy's cabinet that the Soviet Union had armed Cuba and would continue to arm Cuba. "You have surrounded us with military bases," he observed. (von Tunzelmann, 2012)

And of course the fact that America was trying to remove Castro, a Soviet ally, encouraged action from Moscow. The Soviets could hardly hope to see a spread of world communism if they were not seen to defend countries following that path. Von Tunzelmann further explores this by saying:

"The only way to save Cuba is to put missiles there" said Khrushchev [to the Soviet Presidium]. Kennedy, he added, was far too sensible to start a nuclear war, so the point was solely to deter any American invasion. (von Tunzelmann, 2012)

It was not simply Cuba that concerned the United States, who had long held the stated goal of ensuring no European influence in American affairs. J.P.D. Dunbabin stated that:

Since the 1820s it had been a fixed aim of United States policy (enshrined in the Monroe Doctrine) to exclude from the Americas external rule or military involvement... After 1945 it was equally anxious to keep out "international communism". (Dunbabin, 1994)

Russian strategy may have been to manipulate this American desire to avoid a spread of communism on their continent. Whilst the Soviets wished to see a global revolution, a more immediate priority was reducing or even removing the United States' influence in Europe, especially in Germany. After the Bay of Pigs fiasco, the USSR took action in West Berlin by disrupting communication and supply networks into the area (de Groot, 2005). Although NATO countered this, Moscow possibly believed they could use events in Cuba to their own advantage:

Once the Cuban missile sites were operational, Khrushchev planned to announce their existence during a speech at the United Nations. And then he would offer to remove them – if NATO agreed to leave West Berlin. (Schlosser, 2014)

Possible Cause Four: Soviet actions as misguided opportunism

The personal dynamics between Premier Khrushchev and President Kennedy are worth examining too. At the time of the crisis, Khrushchev was age 68 and had led his country for almost a decade; by contrast, Kennedy was age 45 and had been in office fewer than three years. Khrushchev and Kennedy talked on different occasions, with the first meeting taking place at the 1961 Vienna summit. Khrushchev is said to have liked Kennedy, although also believed him to be inexperienced. Following the summit, Kennedy himself remarked Khrushchev "beat the hell" out of him (Dallek, 2004).

Such episodes may have led Khrushchev to see Kennedy as someone to be exploited. This could help the Soviet Union in different ways; not only might it reduce America's military advantage, it could also bring Khrushchev added prestige domestically. Khrushchev's judgement of Kennedy was predicated on a simple assumption: that the president would never risk nuclear war, even over the placement of Soviet missiles in Cuba. Dallek says:

Khrushchev convinced himself however that "intelligent" Kennedy "would not set off a thermonuclear war if there were our warheads there, just as they put the warheads on missiles in Turkey". (Dallek, 2004)

This perspective is echoed by von Tunzelmann. He said that Khrushchev sincerely believed that the US would not stop the USSR placing weapons in Cuba, and told the Cubans this himself:

“You don’t have to worry”, Khrushchev said to Che [Guevara, a Cuban revolutionary]. “There will be no big reaction from the US. And if there is a problem, we will send the Baltic fleet.” (von Tunzelmann, 2012)

However, all of this was clearly an error, Kennedy was acutely aware that a failure to act on Soviet aggression so close to the United States would be interpreted worldwide as a sign of weakness:

Kennedy could simply not afford to allow the Soviets to deploy nuclear weapons in America’s backyard ... He knew that if he permitted the deployment to stand, the American people, Congress and the United States’ NATO allies would interpret it as a complete unwillingness on his part to defend American interests. (Blight et al, 2002)

A confrontation with the USSR also benefited Kennedy in terms of his domestic political landscape. Although his administration had taken various anti-Cuban actions (such as banning most imports from Cuba to the US) Burleigh argues that most ‘voters still thought JFK and the Democrats were weak on the subject of Cuba, leading to enhanced sabre-rattling in the weeks before the mid-term polls in 1962.’ (Burleigh, 2013).

Therefore, Khrushchev’s belief was in fact a catastrophic miscalculation that could have had devastating consequences for the entire world. de Groot sums this up best when he says: ‘Khrushchev’s big mistake was in misjudging Kennedy’ (de Groot, 2005).

Possible Cause Five: Soviet actions as a distraction from domestic problems

The possibility that events in Cuba were planned by Khrushchev as a distraction from his own domestic problems is a theory some historians have also considered. Khrushchev faced a multitude of challenges to his rule. Famously his 1956 so-called ‘Secret Speech’, where he denounced Stalin, caused controversy; it angered many Stalin supporters and others believed that it showed Khrushchev’s limited commitment to communism.

Khrushchev needed to undermine this dissent. The 1961 Tsar Bomba test had shown the world that the Soviets had military power, but that was not the only audience at which a message was aimed as ‘Khrushchev was keen not only to impress those outside the Soviet Union but also those within’ (de Groot, 2005). Ordinary Soviets also had reason to be angry towards their leaders. The summer of 1962 saw KGB troops being deployed to stop public protests following food price increases (Walker, 1994). These had partly risen owing to higher military spending taking precedence over social policies.

Khrushchev faced two contrasting demands: to strengthen his military position, whilst also placating a public unhappy with poverty. Cuba may have given him a chance to fix both problems. Placing weapons in the Caribbean would help him threaten the USA (pleasing his military) without more military spending (satisfying the public). Gerard de Groot expresses this view when he says Khrushchev wanted to:

restrain military spending, against the pressure of the Kremlin hawks. The Cuba gamble might have been an inexpensive way to satisfy hawks (who demanded an answer to American superiority) while still remaining within spending goals (de Groot, 2005)

Robert Dallek echoes this, highlighting the many pressures the Soviet leader faced, and considering the way Cuban action could have alleviated these:

Khrushchev's Cuban plan also rested on a hope of regaining political influence lost because of domestic and foreign setbacks. He had failed to achieve predicted levels of food production, which had forced increases in consumer prices Most important he had failed to close the missile gap between Russia and the United States. (Dallek, 2004)

Conclusion

In reality, none of the multiplicity of events which contributed to the Cuban Crisis can be seen in isolation; whilst each has an individual influence, they also contribute to and affect one other, in explaining why the world came so near to disaster.

Khrushchev did want to defend Castro's government, however this also offered opportunities to overcome the military disadvantages the Soviets had compared to America. Furthermore, the prospect of making real Marx's dream of spreading global communism was appealing, especially if it also helped Khrushchev fight off domestic discord. Equally the Soviets were genuinely angered by the American contradiction of having their missiles in Europe, whilst stopping the Soviets doing likewise in Cuba. Nevertheless, this had been the case for many years, so Khrushchev's actions suggests he saw an opportunity to challenge what he viewed as a new and inexperienced US president.

All of these events converged to create the conditions in which the roots of potential tragedy and horror could grow. Fortunately for the world at large, the story serves as a cautionary tale of how to avoid disaster, rather than how to deal with its aftermath.

References

- Blight, David *et al*, *Cuba on the brink*, Rowman & Littlefield, 2002
Burleigh, Michael. *Small wars, faraway places*, Macmillan, 2013
Dallek, Robert. *John F Kennedy: an unfinished life*, Penguin, 2004
Dunbabin, J. *The Cold War: the great powers and their allies*, Pearson Education Limited, 1994
Gaddis, John Lewis, *The Cold War*, Penguin, 2005
de Groot, Gerard, *The Bomb*, Pimlico, 2005
Hoffman, David, *The Dead Hand*, Icon Books, 2011
Khrushchev, Nikita, *Khrushchev remembers*, Little Brown & Co, 1970
Schlosser, Eric *Command and control*, Penguin, 2014
von Tunzelmann, Alex, *Red Heat*, Simon & Schuster, 2012
Walker, Martin, *The Cold War*, Vintage, 1994
White, Mark, *The Cuban Missile Crisis*, Palgrave Macmillan, 1995

A 'Big Questions' approach to curriculum development in Social Studies

Scott Doyle is a History and Social Studies Teacher at Falkirk High School

It is quite amazing to think that something that started as a collective lunchtime gripe has turned into the most interesting professional collaboration of my career. I am blessed to work in a wonderful faculty with colleagues that I also consider to be friends. Griping, especially after lunch, is something that we do quite often and is almost always good humoured. A collective moan a day keeps the stress levels at bay! This particular gripe, one which I am sure has echoed across many staffrooms, focussed on a lack of general knowledge of the world within our junior classes. The consensus was that this was becoming especially problematic as they moved into the Senior Phase in school. What we considered to be basic knowledge of the world had to be addressed before we could begin to develop the concepts of the courses we were teaching. For example, it became apparent in a class discussion on the Tsar as head of the Russian Orthodox Church, that the vast majority of the class had no understanding that there were different Christian denominations.

As a faculty we had already begun to discuss how we would like to change our S1 curriculum to make it more integrated across the three subjects (History, Geography and Modern Studies) and this conversation triggered a gestalt moment with regard to how we might go about structuring this. In my mind, I thought that our course should give pupils an understanding of the 'Big Questions' in life (although I wasn't completely sure what I meant at this time) and an introduction to the knowledge, understanding, skills, concepts and ideas that we thought were important for their development across Social Subjects and the school. It was a relief that when I discussed this basic idea with my Faculty Head that she positively encouraged me to take it forward. This led to a faculty consultation and a series of meetings on how this might be designed and enacted collaboratively.

Prior to the first meeting, I carried out research on some of the purposes and approaches to Social Studies (Ross 2014, Scottish Government 2009) and began to look at the conceptual understanding required across the subjects as disciplines in their own right. This, coupled with the indicative descriptors of the 4 capacities for learning (Scottish Executive 2004), became the starting point for planning our S1 curriculum. As the thinking behind our S1 course developed, our main rationale was to design a curriculum that helped to frame and nurture our pupils' knowledge, understanding, and curiosity of the big questions related to our world. Our intention was to try to develop a deeper understanding of humanity and their place in the world by investigating questions that would range from the formation of the universe, through human development and impact, and finally to

the future of civilisation and the planet. This key knowledge of humanity, and our place in the world, along with the development of the 4 capacities; pupils as learners, contributors, individuals and citizens (consciously without the adjectives to obscure their meaning) were the main purposes of our new curriculum. All the knowledge, understanding, skills, attributes and capabilities that we set out to develop were derived from these and from the key concepts of History, Geography and Modern Studies education. With this in mind, our new curriculum would be a conflation of subject, civic and issue centred approaches to teaching social subjects where pupils would have the chance to develop the 4 capacities; their knowledge and understanding of humanity and our place in the world; their conceptual knowledge and understanding of the social subjects disciplines and to foster knowledge and understanding of events, issues or developments that they would like to investigate (Appendix 1).

Having worked out our purposes and main approaches we then had to discuss and resolve what we thought would be the best way to frame the learning for our pupils. We were aware of Christian's (2004) Big History Project and other 'Big' approaches such as Harlen's (2015) work on the importance of 'Big Ideas' in science education and we thought it would be interesting to try and develop our course as a series of major enquiry, or 'Big', questions. We wanted to create this independently and specific to our local and national context. Our original outline had 6 'Big Questions' but this was reduced to 5 as we started to plan and develop our learning intentions:

1. CONTEXT: Our world today: What is our world like today?
2. BEGINNINGS: The formation of the universe: How did the universe form?
3. HUMANS: The evolution of Homo Sapiens: Where did humans come from?
4. CIVILISATIONS: Living together: Have humans always lived together?
5. FUTURES: The future for planet Earth: Can we predict our future?

Within each of these units we created a series of enquiry questions (Appendix 2) that we would use to structure the lessons and we paired up across subject disciplines to begin planning the course for the following year. We also decided that we would continue to take a predominantly social-constructivist approach to the learning and teaching by using cooperative learning pedagogies based on the Johnson and Johnson (1989) social model. This approach, which we have used across the faculty for many years, encourages dialogue and discussion as well as promoting social interaction and skills-something that we were prioritising in our pupils' learning and development. The first part of the course, as we taught about our world today, would be heavily weighted towards developing team and social skills and pupils' abilities to use the Microsoft Office suite effectively. These were skills that we felt we needed to develop first to ensure we could use pupils as resources for each other and that they would have developed ICT skills to support their learning and assessment across the year. In terms of assessment, we have tried to ensure in the planning stage that we are assessing the knowledge, understanding and skills we intended to develop in a variety of ways and with an element of pupil choice. We devised a variety of assessments that were designed to show pupils' knowledge and understanding of the contexts for learning; pupils presentation skills; literacy and numeracy skills;

skills in using ICT applications; making reasoned judgements; paired and team working skills; and research skills.

For several years I had been seconded part time to the ITE team at the University of Stirling and I had a number of discussions with Dr Joe Smith on the curriculum ideas that we were implementing in school. Joe showed some interest in the project and commented that it was probably quite unique across Scotland. Joe, who has an academic interest in curriculum development in History and Social Studies education, thought that it would be worthwhile to apply to the British Curriculum Foundation (BCF) for a BCF Curriculum Investigation Grant to research more formally the impact of this approach with our S1 pupils. The BCF Curriculum Investigation Grant is a biennial award intended to support research led by schools and colleges' with a focus on curriculum inquiry and investigation. The grant is worth up to £5,000 for the winner, with £3,500 for two other grants. Applicants must identify an issue impacting on the development of an aspect of the curriculum in their school and then design, implement and evaluate a response to this. After the inquiry is complete, the processes and outcomes must be disseminated within the school or college and a strategy formed to sustain curriculum investigation and inquiry in future years. Joe led the work of drafting the proposal and gaining ethical approval from the University of Stirling to carry out the research. The project would involve the evaluation of the effectiveness of our approach to interdisciplinary social studies with two research questions which could be investigated simultaneously:

1. What are the benefits and limitations of a 'Big Questions' approach to pupil learning in social studies?
2. How might a 'Big Questions' approach encourage collaborative working in integrated social studies faculties?

We decided that to make it manageable our research and data collection would be limited but include staff-peer-lesson observations; the evaluation and assessment of pupil work; online engagement and learning surveys; curriculum development meetings; staff surveys; and staff peer observations. All of these methods already formed part of our faculty's commitment to continuous improvement and so were familiar to staff and pupils alike. We also proposed to set up a buddy structure to allow teachers to share ideas with colleagues in another subject area as well as more formal curriculum development meetings (the minutes of which would form part of the data set). We applied to the BCF for the curriculum grant before we broke up for the summer holidays and we found out at the beginning of August that we had been successful and had secured second place and funding of £3500 to take the project forward. The money is already being used to support the research and the teaching and learning across our Big Questions. Approximately half the money will be used for staffing time to allow school practitioners and Joe to carry out the research and write up of the final 6,000 word report for the BCF for dissemination. The rest of the money has been earmarked for curriculum resources and we have already agreed that a portion of this will be set aside to buy artefact boxes, globes and ICT resources. Discussions are ongoing on how we will use the rest of the funds to support teaching and learning

across the year and to ensure, as required by the BCF conditions, that it is sustainable into future sessions.

There is no getting around the fact that it has been difficult to deliver this as planned during the pandemic. We have tried to mitigate this by delivering team activities and tasks in pairs; the moving of planning and review meetings into video chat applications; the use of pupils own devices to share resources; and by delaying the delivery of ICT skills and applications until the restrictions are reduced. However, because of the constraints put upon in terms of sharing resources, contact tracing, the closure of educational facilities and the use of the schools ICT resources we have had to change our initial learning intentions and outcomes. Hopefully, as we move back into normality in the coming months, we can ensure our curriculum plans and vision are again fully realised in the classroom and the learning spaces beyond.

Find out more about the BERA Curriculum Investigation Grant (including details on how to apply) at <https://tinyurl.com/y3qcdhdg>

References:

- Christian, D. (2004) *Maps of Time: An Introduction to Big History*. University of California Press. Berkeley.
- Harlen, W. (Ed.) (2015) *Working with Big Ideas of Science Education*, Science Education Programme of the Inter-Academy Partnership, Trieste.
- Johnson, D. W. & Johnson R. T. (1989) *Co-operation and Competition: Theory and Research*. Interaction Book Company: Edina, MN.
- Ross, E. W. (Ed.) (2014) *The Social Studies Curriculum: Purposes, Problems, and Possibilities* (Fourth Edition), State University of New York, Albany.
- Scottish Executive (2004): *A Curriculum for Excellence*, Scottish Executive, Edinburgh.
- Scottish Government (2009): *Social Studies Principles and Practice*, Scottish Government, Edinburgh.

Teaching the Srebrenica Genocide

Fiona Malcolm is Vice-Chair of *Remembering Srebrenica, Scotland* and Head of Humanities at the Braes High School, Falkirk

On the 28 June 1914, Archduke Franz Ferdinand was assassinated - it was the spark that ignited the First World War. How many times have we said those words to our pupils? Is there a History teacher in Scotland today who doesn't, or hasn't, taught about the First World War and the assassination's role in it? Probably not. In October 2017, I visited Bosnia-Herzegovina for the first time as part of a delegation with the charity *Remembering Srebrenica Scotland*. I stood on the corner where Franz Ferdinand was assassinated. After teaching this topic for close on twenty years, I was excited. Is it strange that something as mundane as a street corner summons such strong feelings? An incident on a corner, in the early years of the last century; in a city thousands of miles away. Maybe that is why we are History teachers - the human emotions our subject invokes. It isn't just about 'deid folk and dates'. Indeed, much of History is still very much alive. It is a continuous organism ebbing and flowing with cultural, linguistic and educational changes. It is traditional and revised. It is questioned and questioning. It is a story of the human experience and all the joy, heartache, love and hope. For me, that is all encompassed in the teaching of the Srebrenica genocide - a personal journey that began in November 2016; and a journey that continues today.

I was contacted by Andy Lawrence, a History teacher at Hampton School in London via Twitter in November 2016. His group *Genocide80Twenty* were looking for a school to partner with on raising awareness of the Srebrenica genocide. He had seen tweets on the work done in the History department at my school on the Holocaust and wondered if we would be interested in working on a joint project. Absolutely! We teamed up, alongside four other schools in England, to create a memorial of the genocide by writing all 8372 names of the men and boys who were murdered in the letters that spelled out Srebrenica. Braes High were given the letter I and E and 830 names. During our S3 lessons, pupils took turns to write the names of the genocide victims in and around the letters.

This work was presented with an 'Award for Extraordinary Contribution to Srebrenica Education' from the charity *Remembering Srebrenica*, and our collaboration continues.

Both learning about Srebrenica and participating in the collaboration with Hampton School raised more questions than it answered. How could people do this? Why did people do this? As a teacher, I can give them the academic response; as a person, I don't know the answer to those questions because I don't understand that level of hate. While the pupils were writing the names of the dead, they were researching about the survivors and producing posters to tell their stories.

A very, very brief history!

Yugoslavia began to disintegrate in 1991 when two states, Slovenia and Croatia, declared their independence. Six months later, in April 1992, Bosnia, with its multi-cultural history, declared independence. Karadžić, the self-appointed leader of the Bosnia Serbs, declared war against the Bosnian Muslims army. It was a war of aggression to destroy a people – Muslims. And so, in Bosnia in 1992, began the Ten Stages of Genocide. In April 1993, the United Nations declared Srebrenica a 'safe area' under UN protection. Despite that, the United Nations Protection Force's (UNPROFOR) Dutchbat soldiers did not prevent the Bosnian Serb Army of Republika Srpska (VRS) under the command of Ratko Mladić capturing the town and inflicting genocide. From the 5 July 1995 until the 21 July 1995 saw eighteen days of hell rain down on the Bosnian Muslims of Srebrenica: 8372 men and boys were massacred.

Gregory Stanton, President of Genocide Watch, developed the eight stages of genocide in 1996. In 2012, he added a further two.

The stages are:

1. **Classification** - A division of 'us' and 'them'
2. **Symbolisation** – A visual manifestation of hatred
3. **Discrimination** - Dominant group denies civil rights or citizenship to others
4. **Dehumanisation** - Those perceived as 'different' are treated with no form of human rights or dignity
5. **Organisation** – Training and planning
6. **Polarisation** - Propaganda to spread hate
7. **Preparation** - Perpetrators plan the genocide building up armies and weapons
8. **Persecution** – Segregation, deportation, property expropriated, death lists drawn up – massacres begin
9. **Extermination** - Systematic campaign of violence and murder
10. **Denial** - The perpetrators or later generations deny the existence of any crime

In 2004, the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY), located in the Hague, ruled that the actions of the Serbs constituted a genocide. Three years later the abuse of approximately 30,000 women, children, and the elderly, who were forcibly separated from the men, was also declared a genocide.

So why was I interested in teaching about this genocide?

I had been teaching the Holocaust for years. Numerous young people had had the opportunity to participate in *Lessons from Auschwitz* through the *Holocaust Educational Trust (HET)*. Every time, this involvement has a profound impact on them. I attended the Teacher Training course through HET at Yad Vashem – an unbelievable experience. No pupil left my department without knowing something about the Holocaust. However, over the years I felt that pupils believed that genocide ended in 1945 – that it was done and dusted and there was nothing left to learn. In other words, there was a gap. There was a need for learning

progression, cohesion and improvement. Educationalist Elliot Eisner refers to this as the 'null curriculum' – what schools do not teach may be as important as what they do teach. In reality, there have been, and still are, genocides since the Holocaust. Srebrenica was the first genocide on European soil since the Holocaust in the Second World War.

The Srebrenica genocide resonated with me. I was in late high school/early university during the Bosnian War. I remember seeing it on the news, seeing films of the men in concentration camps; starving, beaten, humiliated and wondering, 'What the hell is going on here? Why is the world not doing anything?' After my collaboration with Hampton School, I got involved with the *Remembering Srebrenica Scotland* charity. I have had the privilege of meeting survivors of the war: Nedžad Avdić, one of only a few survivors of the execution squads when he was 17; Reshad Trbonja, aged 19 picked up a weapon to fight in the Siege of Sarajevo and didn't put it down for three years; Hasan Hasanović, aged 19, a genocide survivor, who spoke at my school. These men were boys at the time; they were my age group. 1700 miles separated us, but our lives and experiences were entirely different.

Teaching about genocide can be intellectually and emotionally demanding. There is no doubt that there is an ethical dimension to the teaching of genocide education. It can be difficult for teachers to approach an area of history that is considered to be controversial. I would argue that we need to re-evaluate our thinking and language. Why is it controversial? Is it because we don't have simple answers to difficult questions? Isn't that part of the job? In our fast-changing world, schools have a moral and intellectual responsibility to not allow polarised and convenient politics, fake news, and partial memory get in the way of the facts. It is the role of schools through the curriculum and events to promote global citizenship, human rights and to bear witness for the future.

We, as educators, have a moral responsibility to engage our young people in enquiry and critical thinking more than ever before. The Srebrenica genocide happened within the lifetime of their parents and grandparents. It is living history; history in colour. Many victims and perpetrators are still alive. On 14 December 1995, the peace treaty ending the war, Dayton Agreement, was signed. Bosnia and Herzegovina was sectioned into two parts: Bosnia (which was largely populated by the Croat-Bosniaks) and Republika Srpska (where Serbs were in the majority). The idea was to set up a federal structure to preserve Bosnia as a multi-ethnic state. The town of Srebrenica resides in the area of Republika Srpska. The perpetrators of the war, among them Karadžić and Mladić, were charged and convicted of crimes against humanity and genocide by The International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY), a United Nations court of law located in The Hague. The town synonymous with the genocide, where the final resting place of the victims is at the Potočari Memorial and Cemetery, has had a genocide denier as mayor since 2016; Mladen Grujic, a Serbian nationalist. How does a people move on under such circumstances?

How can you bring Srebrenica education into your school?

The teaching of Srebrenica is something I feel very strongly about. This happened within the lifetime of many of us who are teaching, and of the parents of our young people. The charity is aware that education is a primary focus and

support is available for educational establishments that are keen to introduce this into their curriculum. The charity is organising teacher training events across Scotland and, eventually, pupil visits to Bosnia. In addition, a travelling exhibition is being created that schools can borrow and display.

The Srebrenica genocide can be taught across the curriculum using the lessons as stimuli, background or information: RMPS, English, Art, Drama, PSE. Links can be made to, for example; Rights Respecting Schools, anti-bullying, Equalities groups, Holocaust Memorial Day events.

The Remembering Srebrenica Scotland (RSS) website has a set of four lessons that are ready to use. During this academic session, the Education Committee at RSS are creating a series of lessons including geographical changes in the Balkans region; victims, perpetrators, bystanders; 'gendercide'; international response which will be available for use 2021 – 2022. The lessons can be taught together as a course, in a standalone fashion or in connection to the Holocaust. All lessons come with short, accessible lesson grids, and are linked to the Es&Os and benchmarks.

Why should you bring Srebrenica education into your school?

Teaching about Srebrenica enables young people to explore complex and pertinent issues, as well as their own values and beliefs, and importantly, to engage in discourse, in a safe space. Genocide education breaks down barriers between 'them' and 'us,' and enables our pupils to develop empathy and respect for others - the teaching of genocide furthers the notion of personal responsibility. Young people will question the political decisions of the international community towards Bosnia during the early 90s. They will ask about the rise of nationalism. They will be faced with the human cost of change. They won't like what they hear. They will feel uncomfortable. Their emotions will be heightened. They will disagree with each other. They will argue. It will evoke strong feelings; it will divide opinion. They will feel overwhelmed and powerless. As educators, we must help our young people confront the horrors, but not be overwhelmed by it. History shouldn't be easy. History shouldn't be pleasing. The past shouldn't be wrapped up in a pretty bow. Through teaching about Srebrenica we are faced with the challenge of presenting history that is still very much alive today. Our role is to encourage and accommodate these enquiries. To develop their critical thinking skills. To make controversial statements; play Devil's Advocate.

In short, to make them think.

Contact: fionam@srebrenica.scot

Useful websites:

<https://srebrenica.scot>

<https://www.srebrenicamemorial.org/en>

<https://www.hmd.org.uk/learn-about-the-holocaust-and-genocides/bosnia/>

Developing a series of video clips to support the teaching of the First World War

Kieran Taylor is a PhD Candidate at The University of Stirling and a registered History teacher

This article discusses the development of a series of forthcoming educational videos. These have been designed to support the teaching of the First World War in Scottish schools. The videos have been developed to support pupils at National and Higher phases. They have been funded by the Economic and Social History Society of Scotland (ESHSS) as part of their Education Outreach Fund as a response to the COVID 19 pandemic. They make use of locations and objects related to the history of the First World War in Scotland and use primary sources such as images and videos deposited in digital archives. In discussing the creation of video resources the article examines the wider pedagogy around the use and effect of the video clip in history teaching. It also provides a professional reflection on some of the practicalities and challenges associated with the production of video resources by teachers as well as the current debates around the teaching of the First World War.

ESHSS Educational Outreach Fund

In June 2020 the ESHSS announced funding for the production of ‘exciting’ educational resources to assist secondary school pupils studying Scottish history. This project was borne from discussion around how the ESHSS might contribute toward supporting school pupils during the COVID 19 Lockdown by commissioning early career researchers to deliver innovative educational resources.

The ESHSS, working with the Scottish Association of Teachers of History (SATH), encouraged proposals on the following topics:

- Scotland and the Atlantic Slave Trade
- Scotland and the Suffragettes
- The Scottish Wars of Independence
- Migration and Empire in Scotland, 1830-1939
- Scotland’s role and experience of the First World War
- The earliest Scots – up to and including their battles with the Romans
- Scotland in the time of James I-VI

The ESHSS thus sought contributions from researchers with an interest in Scottish history who would use their knowledge to develop innovative educational materials. The Education Outreach Fund initiative is part of the ESHSS’ wider mission to engage the public with historical research carried out by Scottish researchers.¹⁷ The initial proposal made to the ESHSS Scotland was to produce ten

¹⁷ Edinburgh University Press, Journals, “Scottish Historical Review Education Outreach Fund,” June 2020. Accessed from <https://eupublishing.com/doi/story/10.3366/news.2020.05.26.500344> November 23, 2020.

video clips of five minutes each. These were designed to cover the key issues covered in the National 5 and Higher course specifications for the Scotland and the Great War topics.

Teaching the First World War

Prior to discussing production of the videos it is necessary to examine some of the key debates relating to teaching the First World War and Remembrance. This serves to contextualise the place of the First World War in Scottish education. It has long been argued that the Great War is an obscure and confusing topic for many learners.¹⁸ The protracted nature of the conflict, the futility of the human sacrifice exacted and the complexity of the responses that the subject itself evokes have made the First World War a difficult subject to convey. The passing of the centenary of the First World War has brought renewed focus on the teaching of the Great War in the educational systems of Great Britain. There has been significant national debate about how the First World War is taught. The received account of a War in which 'lions were led by donkeys' has been the source of sharp criticism.¹⁹ Former Education Secretary Michael Gove has described popular representations of the War such as *Oh, What a lovely War!* (1963) and *Blackadder Goes Forth* (1989) as representative of an 'unpatriotic defeatism.'²⁰ To some the War and its outcomes have been misrepresented within the history curriculum.

The narrative of the Western Front as a 'story of the destruction of an army' who were 'machine-gunned, gassed and finally buried' was a representation which emerged during the 1960s.²¹ This representation popularised by Alan Clark's *The Donkeys* fit with the War poetry of Owen, Sassoon and Brooke which featured on the English curricula. Important historical documentaries, such as the BBC's *The Great War* series echoed these sentiments, as oral histories of veterans who experienced the lived reality of trench warfare were critical of the War.²² The collective memory of the War has been codified as a futile conflict.

The Donkeys narrative, however, has been critiqued. Its primary observations are regarded as one-dimensional as its evidence rests too heavily on the experience of veterans of the Western Front. Historians such as Philpott allege that this 'over simplified' account was the product of the 1960s British 'counterculture.'²³ Military historians such as Strachan, Wilson, Prior and Sheffield have expanded understandings of conflict on the Western Front and pushed back at the received historiography particularly in relation to criticisms of Haig's tactics and the Chateau Generals. In focusing on the experience of the British army these historians have charted the military's adaptation toward the reality of mass industrialised conflict.²⁴

¹⁸ Catriona Pennell, "Learning Lessons from War? Inclusions and Exclusions in Teaching First World War History in English Secondary Schools," *History and Memory*, 28 no. 1 (2016), 42.

¹⁹ Alan Clark, *The Donkeys*, (London: Pimlico, 1961).

²⁰ Ann Marie Einhaus, Catriona Pennell, "The First World War in the Classroom: Teaching and the Construction of Cultural Memory," (AHRC, 2014), 29.

²¹ Clark, *Donkeys*, 11.

²² Emma Hanna, *The Great War on the Small Screen: Representing the First World War in Contemporary Britain*, (Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 2009), 83.

²³ William Phillpot, "Revisiting the Great War's Military history a century after the Great War," *French Journal of British Studies*, 20 no. 1 (2015), 2.

²⁴ *Ibid*, 2.

Over emphasis on the Western Front, however, has obscured the War's global theatres and its many colonial conscripts. Increasingly diverse narratives of the War and the contributions made by inhabitants of former colonies are being researched, taught and remembered. The centenary of the War saw new memorials to the contributions made by African Caribbean and South Asian members of the armed forces dedicated in England.²⁵ In Scotland too, *Colourful Heritage* an organisation set up to promote awareness of South Asian history in Scotland have done much to inform students of the contribution made by the 1.7 million personnel of the Indian Army towards the Great War.²⁶ Raising awareness of these diverse contributions has renewed enthusiasm in the teaching of the First World War and encouraged many to think differently about it.

The home front has been the focus historiographical attention by historians such as Marwick, Winter, Lawrence and Pedersen.²⁷ Their research has expanded understandings of the War's lasting effects on British society. The war is thus identified as a catalyst for political, economic and social change in Britain. This has been reflected in the history curriculum as discussion of the home front entails examination of the suffrage movement, industrial unrest and the Fourth Reform Act.

Debate over how the First World War should be taught exists alongside a greater and more political dispute concerning Remembrance in schools. David Aldridge has argued that the place of Remembrance in schools should be challenged.²⁸ In Aldridge's opinion the overt patriotism associated with Remembrance encourages gratitude toward past military sacrifice rather than education regarding the many 'horrors' of conflict.²⁹ Danilova and Dollan support Aldridge. They note, in their study of Scottish Remembrance resources, that they served to instil a 'war normalising' logic.³⁰ Danilova and Dollan argue that Remembrance is a 'political education practice' which should be remade by emphasizing critical thinking when conflict is discussed.³¹ The continuing commemoration of the First World War in schools, therefore requires re-examination.

It has been assumed that the historiographical trend in British schools has favoured Clark's interpretation of the War.³² The *Blackadder* school, as it has been termed, has encouraged young people to perceive the War as an Imperialistic

²⁵ "First ever memorial to African and Caribbean Service Personnel unveiled in Brixton," *Caribbean Times*, June, 27, 2017, <http://www.timescaribbeanonline.com/first-ever-memorial-african-caribbean-service-personnel-unveiled-brixton/> Last Accessed November 24, 2020; "Senseless and cowardly": UK's first Sikh soldier statue vandalised," *ITV*, November 10, 2018, <https://www.itv.com/news/central/2018-11-10/uks-first-statue-of-sikh-soldier-vandalised> Last Accessed November 24, 2020.

²⁶ *Colourful Heritage, The British Indian Army in World War I*, (Colourful Heritage, Glasgow Museums, 2020).

²⁷ Arthur Marwick, *The Deluge: British Society and the First World War*, (London: Bodley Head, 1965); Jay Winter, *The Great War and the British People*, (Harvard: Harvard University Press, 1986); Jon Lawrence, "Forging a Peaceable Kingdom War, Violence, and Fear of Brutalization in Post-First World War Britain," *The Journal of Modern History*, 75 no. 3 (2003); Susan Pedersen, "Gender, Welfare and Citizenship during the Great War," *The American Historical Review*, 95 no. 4, (1990).

²⁸ David Aldridge, "How War Ought to be Remembered in Schools?" *Impact: Philosophical Perspectives on Education Policy*, no. 21 (2014), 5.

²⁹ *Ibid*, 5.

³⁰ Nataliya Danilova, Emma Dolan, "The Politics and Pedagogy of War Remembrance," *Childhood*, 27 no. 3 (2020), 12.

³¹ *Ibid*, 13.

³² Stephen Badsey, "The Great War Since the Great War," *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television*, 22 no. 1 (2002), 43.

conflict which provides a moral lesson in being wary of jingoism and the call to arms.³³ Nevertheless, recent studies by Einhaus and Pennel into the teaching of the First World War in England have found that teachers incorporate a variety of perspectives when discussing the War.³⁴ The authors noted that across England the complexity, nuance and diversity of the War is being conveyed to students.³⁵ While the studies discussed in this literature review offer an overview of the teaching of the First World War in both England and to a lesser Scotland, further study is needed to provide a fuller picture of the War's place in the curricula of all the devolved nations.

The First World War in the Scottish Curriculum

The teaching of the First World War currently in Scotland is not statutory, however, it is likely all pupils will encounter the subject at some point in secondary school within history, English or Religious and Moral Education. In Smith's survey of history syllabi across Scottish schools he found that five of twenty-one schools surveyed taught the First World War as part of the Broad General Education curriculum.³⁶ The First World War, is of course, an option which can be covered within certificated history classes at the National or Higher phase too.

Despite the global ramifications of the First World War, the subject is examined as part of the Scottish component of certificated history classes rather than as part of the British or European components. The primary focus of the course examines Scot's role on the Western Front as well as the impact of the War on Scottish society, politics and the economy.³⁷ While this may seem parochial, considering the relationship of the First World War to international relations in the twentieth century, historians are in agreement about the lasting and irrevocable impact that the Great War had on Scotland.³⁸ The Era of the Great War's themes reflect primarily on the home front and encourage learners to consider how conflict influenced social and political change.

Video Clips and the Scottish Curriculum

The videos have been developed to support learners at the National and Higher phases. While there is no shortage of video resources for the history curriculum available online, few are relevant to the Scottish component of the curriculum. Those videos relating to the Scottish context that do exist are often not designed for a classroom context. The video series hopes to contribute to the

³³ Ibid, 43.

³⁴ Ann Marie Einhaus, Catriona Pennel, "The First World War in the Classroom: Teaching and the Construction of Cultural Memory," (AHRC, 2014), 69.

³⁵ Ibid, 69.

³⁶ Joseph Smith, "Curriculum coherence and teachers' decision making in Scottish high school history syllabi," *The Curriculum Journal*, 30 no. 4 (2018).

³⁷ Scottish Qualifications Authority, *Higher History Course Specification*, (SQA, 2019), 55; Scottish Qualifications Authority, *National 5 History Course Specification*, (SQA, 2019), 8.

³⁸ David Goldie, "Scotland, Britishness and the First World War," in *Beyond Scotland: New Contexts for Twentieth-Century Scottish Literature*, ed. Gerrard Carruthers, David Goldie, Alastair Renfrew, (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2004); Richard J. Finlay, "The Rise and Fall of Popular Imperialism in Scotland," *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, 113 no. 1 (1997); Cameron McKay, "Ex-Servicemen and Crime in Interwar Scotland," (University of Stirling, Dissertation Thesis: 2019). While historians agree that the War's impact was central to many of the changes which Scottish society experienced academics take divergent views on the specific implications of the War for Scotland. Nevertheless the War is regarded as influencing amongst other things; support for Union and Home Rule, the polarisation of local politics, the break-up of the family and a rise in crime.

available educational resources designed to support the teaching of National and Higher courses.

While there is a relative dearth of high-quality video resources on Scottish history, there is an abundance of visual material relevant to the First World War deposited in Scottish archives and online. The production of a video resource on the subject of the Great War therefore hopes to distil the vast array of available primary sources for the benefit of teachers and students for future use.

Proposal

The aim for the resource was that the produced video clips could be utilised by either a teacher within a classroom setting or by students at home as an aid to revision. It was intended that the series of videos would cover the entirety of the themes which compose the Impact of the Great War topic.³⁹

The format of the videos would have a presenter deliver each clip from a different location relevant or discuss an object pertinent to the theme covered. Each video would additionally incorporate a relevant piece of source material. Source material was taken from available collections at the National Library of Scotland's Moving Image Archive, as well as the Imperial War Museum, Glasgow City Archives and SCRAN. Each video aimed to include a one-page fact file related to the theme, the fact file would give a summary of the key information discussed in the video and provide extracts and references to any primary source material featured. In addition to this to ensure that the videos were a valuable study aid, a related exam style question would be included. As would references to relevant historiography and further reading to benefit students studying at the Higher phase.⁴⁰ References to historiography serve to challenge more able pupils, while incorporating primary sources into the video offer the teacher prompts to ask higher order questions.

Example 1

This video focuses on the theme of voluntary recruitment and is shot outside the City Chambers in Glasgow. The initial piece to camera is interlaced with footage from a video reel from Scotland's Moving Image archive showing the march of volunteers from Glasgow Corporation's Tramway's Department outside the City Chambers who had joined the Highland Light Infantry.⁴¹ Stills of propaganda posters are additionally shown and explained.⁴² An explanation of the variety of reasons why Scots volunteered to join the army are delineated. Reference is made to relevant written primary source material such as a newspaper article on voluntary recruitment.⁴³ At the end of the video a list of bullet

³⁹ Scottish Qualifications Authority, *Higher History Course Specification*, (SQA, 2019), 55; Scottish Qualifications Authority, *National 5 History Course Specification*, (SQA, 2019), 8. Both the National 5 and Higher qualifications cover four key issues as part of the Era of the Great War and the Impact of the Great War topics; Scots on the Western Front, the impact of the war on society, politics and the economy.

⁴⁰ Catriona, M. M. Macdonald and Elaine, M. McFarland, *Scotland and the Great War*, (Edinburgh: Tuckwell Press, 1999).

⁴¹ National Library of Scotland Moving Image Collection, Film 3320, "Response of Glasgow Tramway Men to the Country's Call to Arms", September 7, 1914. Accessed from <https://movingimage.nls.uk/film/3220> May 15 2020

⁴² Imperial War Museum Archive, "Who can beat this Plucky Four?", Poster, 1915, PST 13632.

⁴³ "Glasgow Tramwaymen's Battalion", *The Scotsman*, September 8, 1914, 7.

points on the primary reasons for recruitment are provided along with a series of relevant statistics for learners.

Example 2

This video examines radicalism and civil unrest in Scotland. The opening shot shows the statue of, the political radical and Rent Strike organiser, Mary Barbour at Govan Cross in Glasgow and in some of the streets associated with the Rent Strike in Partick and Shettleston. Barbour's role in the Rent Strikes is discussed and this is related to the wider Red Clydeside phenomenon and the politicisation of the working class and growth in support for the ILP. Stills from the Rent Strikes are included as are references to John Wheatley, James Maxton and John MacClean. Extracts from left wing weekly *Forward's* coverage of the strike are read as are snippets from Willie Gallacher's *Revolt on the Clydeside*.⁴⁴ Additional newsreel footage of later political protests in Scotland regarding housing are used to illustrate that radicalism was an ongoing feature of Scottish politics after the War.⁴⁵ At the end of the video a summary of the most important information is provided in bullet points.

Video Features and Differentiation

As Watkins and Wilkins observe, video is a valuable technology for teachers in supporting learners who struggle to access the curriculum.⁴⁶ Video allows students to see and hear sometimes hard to explain subjects, actions and ideas. The design of the series aims to enhance differentiation in the classroom. The brief nature of the videos, between five to six minutes, serve to discourage learners from losing interest. Furthermore, ideas are explained in plain English and where appropriate definitions of potentially unfamiliar vocabulary are given on screen.

As the discussed examples make apparent the videos are designed to benefit learning and teaching in their structure and approach. For instance, the locations have specifically been chosen because of their association with the First World War and Scotland. In focusing on well-known or culturally important sites such as George Square or the National War memorial at Edinburgh Castle the aim is to build on learners' familiarity and create an association between students' sense of geography and the subject covered.

Other features of the videos such as the provision of a bullet point summary at the end additionally serve to give the teacher or student the opportunity to pause the video to take notes. The inclusion of fact files which provide written primary source material equally offer students time to engage with primary sources discussed on screen. The provision of clear references to primary sources and historiography give further opportunity for scholarship.

⁴⁴ "Fifteen Thousand Glasgow Tenants on Strike," *Forward*, November, 30, 1915; Willie Gallacher, *Revolt on the Clyde: An Autobiography*, (London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1949).

⁴⁵ British Pathé Archive, Film 356.21, "Rent Strike. Mr. David Kirkwood - the Scottish Socialist, M.P. - addresses Mass Meeting of Tenants on the Clydebanks," September 25, 1924. Accessed from <https://www.britishpathe.com/video/rent-strike/query/rent+strikes> November 11, 2020.

⁴⁶ Jon Watkins, Michael Wilkins, "Using YouTube in the EFL Classroom," *Language Education in Asia*, 2, no 1, (2011), 113.

Thus, short videos are extremely valuable in the history classroom. They serve to both enhance and consolidate learning.⁴⁷ They are a useful motivator and can be a source of inspiration, as the teacher elicits what students identify on screen. Visual primary sources such as reel footage, propaganda posters and photographs provide vivid insight into what War was like and give students a ‘feel’ for the time period.⁴⁸ For many learners seeing historical material on screen brings the past to life.

Reflection on Producing Video Resources

Video clips form a core part of learners’ educational diet in the twenty first century. As a history teacher I use them frequently to provide learners with stimulus prior to introducing or discussing a topic. Prior to embarking on this project I had some limited experience of producing short educational videos for classes and recording podcasts. This venture, however, presented me with new considerations. In taking responsibility for the video series I would have to act as writer, presenter and director. As noted earlier there are relatively few video clips designed specifically for the Scottish curriculum, I thus set out to use my experience as a teacher and a historian of the First World War to contribute to the production of a high quality resource that would benefit others.

In the initial proposal made to the EHSS I had noted my intention to work with a colleague who runs a video production company. Working with a videographer ensured that my main focus would be the content of the videos, sourcing archived material and the production of the fact files. Through storyboarding initial ideas we were able to produce a clear overview of how we wanted the videos to look and sound. Thus, the format adopted would be documentary style with myself serving as the presenter. Piece to camera would be interlaced with archive footage and images relevant to the topic. Music would be played in the background of each video to ensure that the archive footage did not appear flat.

While I had made the initial proposal without the videographer, their input following receiving the grant was important in influencing a number of changes made. For example, the initial plan to produce ten videos covering most aspects of the course content had to be reviewed because of the laborious process of recording and editing recorded material. Thus, it was agreed that a smaller number of four videos would be made. This led me to narrow my focus to some aspects of the home front notably recruitment, radicalism, the role of women and remembrance.

Other challenges encountered in making this video related to use of archive footage and images. In selecting this material I had to ensure that this was copyright free. Requesting use of permissions was done on a case by case basis. This has been time-consuming and has made the inclusion of archive footage challenging. This of course has been disappointing and has had the result of affecting or changing aspects of the videos, as material initially selected cannot be

⁴⁷ Chauncey Montey-Sano, Susan De La Paz, Mark Felton, *Writing About History Teaching*, (Columbia, New York, Teachers College Press, 2014), 10.

⁴⁸ Ashley Wiersma, “A Study of Teaching Methods of High School History Teachers,” *The Social Studies*, 99, no 3. (2008), 112.

used. Nevertheless, archivists at the various repositories contacted have been helpful in identifying copyright free footage and negotiating access to this.

In addition to this, the on-going COVID 19 restrictions have hindered the recording and editing process. Travel restrictions and limitations on meeting have had a significant impact on shooting or accessing archives. This has held up the production of the videos meaning so far that only one of the four videos has been able to be shot.

Conclusions

This article has detailed a forthcoming series of video resources designed to support National and Higher students studying the First World War. It has outlined some of the key debates in education regarding the First World War and has illustrated that the Scots' curriculum examines the Great War through the subject of the home front and the impact of the War upon wider Scottish society.

The value and role of the video clip in history teaching has been highlighted, as has the process of designing and producing a video resource. The author hopes that the professional reflection discussed in this article details the associated challenges in producing video resources for the history curriculum. In particular, the challenge of securing use of archive footage is emphasized.

Video resources are an excellent method of engaging learners within history. It is hoped that the series of videos as part of the ESHSS' Education Outreach grant, when completed, will contribute to teaching and learning about the First World War in Scottish schools.

References

Primary

British Newspaper Archive, 'Glasgow Tramwaymen's Battalion', *The Scotsman*, September 8, 1914, 7.

British Pathé Archive, Film 356.21, 'Rent Strike. Mr. David Kirkwood - the Scottish Socialist, M.P. - addresses Mass Meeting of Tenants on the Clydebank,' September 25, 1924. Accessed from <https://www.britishpathe.com/video/rent-strike/query/rent+strikes> November 11, 2020.

Glasgow City Archive, Fifteen Thousand Glasgow Tenants on Strike,' *Forward*, November, 30, 1915
Imperial War Museum Archive, 'Who can beat this Plucky Four?', Poster, 1915, PST 13632.

National Library of Scotland Moving Image Collection, Film 3320, 'Response of Glasgow Tramway Men to the Country's Call to Arms', September 7, 1914. Accessed from <https://movingimage.nls.uk/film/3220> May 15 2020.

Secondary

Aldridge, D. 'How War Ought to be Remembered in Schools?' *Impact: Philosophical Perspectives on Education Policy*, no. 21 (2014), 5.

Badsey, S. 'The Great War Since the Great War,' *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television*, 22 no. 1 (2002).

Caribbean Times, 'First ever memorial to African and Caribbean Service Personnel unveiled in Brixton,' *Caribbean Times*, June, 27, 2017. Accessed from <http://www.timescaribbeanonline.com/first-ever-memorial-african-caribbean-service-personnel-unveiled-brixton/> November 24, 2020

Clark, A. *The Donkeys*, (London: Pimlico, 1961)

- Colourful Heritage, The British Indian Army in World War I, (Colourful Heritage, Glasgow Museums, 2020).
- Danilova, N. Dolan, E. 'The Politics and Pedagogy of War Remembrance,' *Childhood*, 27 no. 3 (2020).
- Einhaus, A.M. Pennel, C. 'The First World War in the Classroom: Teaching and the Construction of Cultural Memory,' (AHRC, 2014).
- Edinburgh University Press, Journals, 'Scottish Historical Review Education Outreach Fund,' June 2020.
- Accessed from <https://eupublishing.com/doi/story/10.3366/news.2020.05.26.500344> November 23, 2020.
- Finlay, R. 'The Rise and Fall of Popular Imperialism in Scotland,' *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, 113 no. 1 (1997).
- Gallacher, W. *Revolt on the Clyde: An Autobiography*, (London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1949).
- Goldie, D. 'Scotland, Britishness and the First World War,' in *Beyond Scotland: New Contexts for Twentieth-Century Scottish Literature*, edited by Gerrard Carruthers, David Goldie, Alastair Renfrew, (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2004).
- Hanna, E. *The Great War on the Small Screen: Representing the First World War in Contemporary Britain*, (Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 2009).
- ITV News, 'Senseless and cowardly': UK's first Sikh soldier statue vandalised,' ITV, November 10, 2018, <https://www.itv.com/news/central/2018-11-10/uks-first-statue-of-sikh-soldier-vandalised> November 24, 2020.
- Lawrence, J. 'Forging a Peaceable Kingdom War, Violence, and Fear of Brutalization in Post-First World War Britain,' *The Journal of Modern History*, 75 no. 3 (2003).
- Macdonald, C.M. McFarland, E.M. *Scotland and the Great War*, (Edinburgh: Tuckwell Press, 1999).
- Marwick, A. *The Deluge: British Society and the First World War*, (London: Bodley Head, 1965)
- Montey-Sano, C. De La Paz, S. Felton, M. *Writing About History Teaching*, (Columbia, New York, Teachers College Press, 2014).
- McKay, C. 'Ex-Servicemen and Crime in Interwar Scotland,' (University of Stirling, Dissertation Thesis: 2019).
- Pedersen, S. 'Gender, Welfare and Citizenship during the Great War,' *The American Historical Review*, 95 no. 4, (1990).
- Pennell, C. 'Learning Lessons from War? Inclusions and Exclusions in Teaching First World War History in English Secondary Schools,' *History and Memory*, 28 no. 1 (2016).
- Phillipot, W. 'Revisiting the Great War's Military history a century after the Great War,' *French Journal of British Studies*, 20 no. 1 (2015).
- Scottish Qualifications Authority, *Higher History Course Specification*, (SQA, 2019).
- Scottish Qualifications Authority, *National 5 History Course Specification*, (SQA, 2019).
- Smith, J. 'Curriculum coherence and teachers' decision making in Scottish high school history syllabi,' *The Curriculum Journal*, 30 no. 4 (2018).
- Watkins, J. Wilkins, M. 'Using YouTube in the EFL Classroom,' *Language Education in Asia*, 2, no 1, (2011), 113.
- Wiersma, A. 'A Study of Teaching Methods of High School History Teachers,' *The Social Studies*, 99, no 3. (2008), 112.
- Winter, J. *The Great War and the British People*, (Harvard: Harvard University Press, 1986)

Scotland's Heroines: The Representation of Women in Scotland's Secondary Curriculum

Bryony E. Mole is a History and Social Studies teacher at McLaren High School, Stirling

History is about understanding the past and all its diversity; history which ignores one half of the human race is bad history (Osler, 1994).

Studies by Osler (1994) and Lockyer and Tazzyman (2016) have expressed a concerning lack of representation of women's history within the English curriculum which restricts study of women's history to monarchs and suffragettes. Furthermore, this representation of women's history is largely presented in a separate unit rather than integrated into the curriculum, 'othering' historical study on women. This concern can be extended to the current Scottish curriculum. Academics such as Abrams (2011) have emphasised how academia on Scottish women - and the study of women's history in Western historiography - has expanded considerably during recent decades; but this expansion is yet to be reflected in Scottish classroom practice. This work will address why an inclusive curriculum of both genders is important and the current situation concerning the representation of Scottish women in the Scottish secondary school curriculum. Finally, this work will give recommendations on both the achievements and milestones of some Scottish women that could be naturally included within the Scottish curriculum and changes that could be made to take meaningful strides towards greater gender inclusivity in Scotland's secondary history curriculum.

What is 'Women's History'?

To discuss the issues concerning women's history representation in the Scottish curriculum we must first define the term 'women's history'. Academics suggest that the term 'women's history' has origins in the mid-20th century as a result of growing interest concerning historical women and the influence of feminist movements within academia (Kent, 2012; Lerner, 1975). Murphy (1992) states women's history could be described as the study of history where women are the subject focus. This term is perhaps an over-simplification of the complexity and diversity of women's history in modern scholarship. Nevertheless, due to the clarity it provides, this definition will be applied by this paper. Women's history cannot be considered as indistinguishable from feminist history, as feminist history considers history from an ideologically feminist standpoint (Rowbotham, 1973). This deviates from 'women's history' as historians focusing on women as the subject matter of historical academia do not always inherently hold feminist views (Murphy, 1992). It should also be noted that 'women's history' does not define women as one

homogenous group but recognises and discusses the diversity of women's historical experiences (MacIntosh 1983).

Why Teach About Scotland's Women?

With limited space and time in current secondary curricula, the question is raised 'why teach women's history?'. Educators such as Levstik and Groth (2002), and Crocco (1997) stress the lack of women's history in Western education curricula is an issue which should be addressed. Both have highlighted in their research that an imbalance of gender equality within the history curriculum impacts students' perceptions and can lead to the inaccurate assumption that women have historically done little that is 'noteworthy'. This view is reflected in Lockyer and Tazzymant's (2016) study on pupils views on women within the English curriculum where one student stated, 'I don't think it's deliberately more about men though, without being sexist, there is more to learn about men, they've done more' (Lockyer and Tazzymant, 2016, p.11). MacIntosh (1983) also warns that the absence of women in history curricula or presenting women as 'victims' throughout society, gives pupils little to aspire to in terms of historical role-models and could lead to the normalisation of women in a subordinate role. It can therefore be argued that the teaching of 'noteworthy' Scottish women within the Scottish curriculum can challenge assumptions that women have not contributed to society and provides historical role models for students. This work is focussed on including Scottish women as part of education on Scottish history. However, women could of course be included in other areas of historical study.

Current Representation of Women in the Scottish Secondary Curriculum

Scotland has taken strides to promote gender inclusivity throughout multiple disciplines within both primary and secondary education. This is evidenced by resources such as 'Gender Equality: A Toolkit for Education Staff' (Scottish Executive, 2007). The document emphasises recommendations to promote inclusion of all genders within school environments, including looking historically at the perspectives of both genders. Whilst these guidelines are commendable, the extent to which they are implemented in the Scottish curriculum, including history, is debatable. Scotland's secondary history curriculum can largely be divided into two sections, junior level, known as Broad General Education (BGE) and the Senior Level which includes more prescriptive documents about the topics and people studied within Scottish schools.

Broad General Education (BGE)

Scotland's BGE phase has a largely non-prescriptive approach in specifying actual content, focusing more on the skills students should gain from their subjects. The Scottish Government has outlined goals for Primary and BGE level students known as the 'Experiences and Outcomes' (hereafter E's and O's) which highlights desired knowledge and skills. The history component of E's and O's (titled 'people, past events and societies') gives some guidance on what should be taught, stressing focus on the history of Scotland (Education Scotland, n.d). Besides references to 'local' or 'Scottish' history' the Scottish Government entrusts subject content largely to educators, therefore giving teachers opportunities to be curriculum developers at BGE level (Smith, 2019).

As BGE documents specify a requirement to teach 'Scottish' or 'local' history it follows that Scottish women could be included to meet this condition. In fact it can be argued that including women's history at BGE level is vital in students having a balanced understanding of the past, as Smith finds that around 50% of pupils will not take history as a further subject in their senior phase (Smith, 2019). Thus, these initial years should include aspects of women's history or risk the possibility of giving students the impression that woman did not significantly contribute to society (Pearson, 2012).

Smith (2019) argues based on his study of the curriculum within an array of Scottish schools that many tend to focus on specific periods of history. He notes that most schools teach milestones such as World War One and the Wars of Independence. These topics centre on political or military history which, as both Woyshner (2002) and McDermid (2011) stress, are largely male dominated. McDermid (2011) suggests that Scottish history is often associated with masculinity, with much of the literature focusing on 'great battles' and heroic figures. This is highlighted by the fact that historic sites such as the National Wallace Monument's Hall of Heroes predominantly features the achievements of Scottish men. Two women are featured out of the eighteen busts in the hall, and these women were only recently added to the display in April 2019 (The National Wallace Monument, n.d). McDermid (2011) stresses that in order to change this narrative, new scholarship on the contribution and viewpoint of Scottish women in political and military events, such as that of World War One and the Wars of Independence which are commonly taught in the BGE curriculum, must be utilised. Whilst the teaching of these topics is not universally applied to all Scottish BGE history classrooms, it can be said the general trend is to focus on these traditionally male-dominated topics due to an abundance of Scottish based resources and literature available.

Senior Phase

In general, senior phase documentation puts more emphasis on the inclusion of women in various aspects of the history curriculum, not limiting this to specifically Scottish history. The senior phase has an increased prescriptive approach, particularly at National 5 and Higher as the content of these courses relates to exams written by the Scottish Qualifications Authority (hereafter SQA). Notable women and women's movements are explicitly mentioned within the course guide and must be covered if schools choose to study these topics. Thus, in the Senior Phase it is likely that pupils studying history will experience some sort of women's history compared to the BGE phase.

Within the National 5 and Higher course specifications women are primarily mentioned in three contexts: monarchs, activists and war workers. The National 5 course has one female orientated course titled '*Mary Queen of Scots, and the Reformation, 1542–1587*' (SQA 2019, p5), Mary is also explicitly mentioned in the Higher course specification under the topic '*The Age of the Reformation, 1542–1603*' (SQA 2019, p22). Other reference is made to the work of women in units which discuss the suffragettes, suffragists and changing role of Scottish women during World War One. This gives flexibility to discuss variety of women such as Mary Barbour and Elsie Inglis, whilst not explicitly mentioning these women in the guidelines. Whilst the focus on 'exceptional others' such as monarchs, suffragettes

and rent strikers has been criticised by scholars such as MacIntosh (1983) for not truly reflecting the experiences of most women at the time, it remains a step forward in providing examples of politically engaged female role models and challenging potential assumptions that women have not contributed significantly to political or military changes throughout history.

Whilst these topics are moving to a more gender balanced curriculum, issues have been identified. For example, whilst efforts have been made to explore women's political activity through units discussing women's enfranchisement and activism, this rarely goes beyond a lone section or exam question. The compartmentalisation of women in the Scottish curriculum reduces women to 'the other' and apart from 'normative' narratives. This has been similarly expressed in studies on the English and American curriculum by academics such as Crocco (1997) and Osler (1994). Noddings (2001) called this the 'add and stir' approach. Noddings (2001) defines this as adding women's history in western education curricula as a separate unit or heading other than 'normal' history focusing on 'women's work' rather than just the work of all genders including women. Levstik (2009) and Noddings (2001) note that separating 'women's history' from 'mainstream' study can lead to women's history being perceived as an add-on. It should be noted that, with the exception of monarchs, women's contribution to history is largely only present in areas that focus on the late 19th and early to mid-20th century. This issue is similarly highlighted in the English curriculum in Lockyer and Tazzymant's study which states:

they (students) appeared to think that women had been completely shackled by patriarchy... before 1900... in seeking to demonstrate how momentous the women's suffrage movement ... was for women, some history teachers may have unintentionally undermined students' ideas about women who lived before the twentieth century. (Lockyer and Tazzymant, 2016, p.11)

Despite these limitations it should be noted that the inclusion of women throughout various topics in the Scottish senior secondary curriculum remains a meaningful step toward a gender balanced history curriculum. As Noddings (2001) and MacIntosh (1983) state exploration into the lives of 'notable' women in the past is preferential to no exploration at all. However, the curriculum could do more to explicitly mention female figures rather than ambiguous headings which gives flexibility to largely leave out women's contribution.

Whose Story and How?

It is important to have women's narratives and viewpoints present in a variety of topics throughout both BGE and senior phase. It is recommended that these are naturally integrated throughout the curriculum regularly rather than as a separate unit or lessons falling into this pattern of 'add and stir' (Noddings,2001). This section will focus on notable Scottish women that could be included within the curriculum both at BGE and senior level in various topics that are already frequently taught within the Scottish curriculum. It will also highlight several key resources that could be utilised for further study on Scottish women's history which educators could use within the classroom. This section is not exhaustive, there are countless Scottish women who could be discussed in schools to give a wider representation

of women in different time periods of Scottish history. When potentially discussing women's narratives within the classroom it should be done alongside rather than as a juxtaposition to the dominant male viewpoints in order to create an integrated curriculum rather than dividing it into 'regular history' aka the traditionally male dominated topics and 'women's history' as women's history should be viewed as an inclusive part of the history curriculum rather than as a side note (Lockyer and Tazzymant, 2016). These examples will include, but will not be limited to, the 19th and 20th century where exploration and documentation of women's history has considerably more resources.

As many Scottish schools cover the Wars of Independence at BGE or Senior level women such as Isabella MacDuff could be included as well as the often already discussed 'Maid of Norway'. Isabella MacDuff, Countess of Buchan was an important figure in the Scottish Wars of Independence, she was married to John Comyn Earl of Buchan, however when her husband turned to the English side during the Wars of Independence, she did not follow his lead. Isabella, against her husband's wishes, crowned Robert the Bruce, as Scottish kings had traditionally been crowned by a member of clan MacDuff. When Robert the Bruce was defeated at the Battle of Methven, Isabella was captured by Edward II's men and spent at least 4 years in a cage. Isabella was eventually released but little is written about the rest of her life. Her act of defiance was crucial to Robert the Bruce having legitimacy in Scotland. Several books discuss Isabella's contributions such as *Proud Lady in a Cage* (Urquhart, 1980) and she is mentioned in *Scotland: Her Story: The Nation's History by the Women Who Lived It* (Goring, 2018) which provides primary resources, which could be used in the classroom. Additionally, other Scottish women such as Susannah Crawford and Christina MacRuaridh (known as Christina 'of the Isles') also played significant roles in supporting Robert the Bruce and his cause for Scottish Independence (Ewan and Meikle, 1998), these women could also be included in classroom content.

Another notable woman prior to the 19th century is Lady Agnes Campbell, who led troops for Irish resistance against the English and helped gain support for Irish resistance in Scotland in the late 1500's (Goring, 2018). Some schools may look at the Jacobite rebellion in which the valiant efforts of Flora MacDonald could be discussed. MacDonald aided the infamous Bonnie Prince Charlie in fleeing from Scotland following his defeat at the Battle of Culloden in 1746 (Johnson, n.d).

Additionally, academia has seen a surge of resources about inspirational Scottish women in the 19th and 20th century such as the 'Edinburgh Seven' who were the first women to be accepted into a medical degree in the UK. Among them included Scottish born Elsie Inglis who was one of the first women to set up her own medical practice in Scotland and went on to play a huge role in WW1 setting up the Scottish Women's Hospitals Committee treating wounded soldiers on the front lines. Furthermore, women in the political sphere such as Rent Strike leader Mary Barbour and Katherine Marjory, the first Scottish female MP elected in 1923 and by 1924 she also held the role of parliamentary secretary to the Board of Education (Knox, 2006).

The aforementioned Scottish women make up only a small selection of examples of the meaningful contributions in Scotland's political and military landscape that women have been involved in from as early as the 13th century. As

such, these women should be known throughout modern Scotland. To quote Bettany Hughes:

There are brilliantly feisty women from history who have made an impact. We need to actively look for women's stories, and put them back into the historical narrative, there are so many women that should be household names but just aren't. (Hughes, 2016)

Modern resources that can be used in educational practice are available, such as Rosemary Goring's book *Scotland: Her Story: The Nation's History by the Women Who Lived It* (2018) which uses an abundance of primary resources to show the nation's history through the eyes of women. Additionally, Scotland is home to the only credited UK museum dedicated to women, the Glasgow Women's Library, which has resources both on women in Scotland and worldwide (Glasgow Women's Library, 2020). In addition to the growing number of published books on Scottish women's history, online articles are increasingly available to educators.

Admittedly, barriers to including women's history cannot be ignored. Crocco (1997) and Pearson (2012) highlight that lack of finances for new resources, and availability of varied teaching materials is an undeniable obstacle to including women's history at secondary level. However, these historians also argue that resources cannot be the singular reason for absence of women's history as contemporary academia provides a growing supply of primary and secondary resources free online. Woyshner (2002) argues that more needs to be done by educators to challenge the assumption that women have not been involved in political and military events. The preceding section contains several examples of how women have been involved, and have been independent, in making political decisions in Scotland for centuries, their stories should be told. The inclusion of women in history curriculum does not require a complete overhaul but that little changes and inclusions will build up over time to a gender inclusive curriculum.

Where can more resources be found?

One key barrier to the inclusion of women's history in the classroom is the lack of readily available resources. This section will focus on providing a handful of examples of books, websites and other resources that could be utilised within the classroom. Schools that are local to the central of Scotland may want look at trips to the Glasgow Women's Library which provide numerous resources on both Scottish and international women that could be used for class resources. This could also be said for the Wallace Monument Hall of Heroes which has recently had the addition of two Scottish heroines, Mary Slessor and Maggie Keswick Jencks, information on these women can be found on the Wallace Monument Website and from visitation to the hall itself (The National Wallace Monument, 2015). Additionally, schools who do not have this opportunity could use online resources such as the Women's History Scotland website which have committed to promoting the study of Scottish women's history both in academia and in primary and secondary education. This website not only provides numerous online resources but also mentions several key books which could also be used such as the '*New Biographical Dictionary of Scottish Women*', '*The Documentary History of Women in 19th Century Scotland*' and '*The Biographical Dictionary of Scottish*

Women and Gender in Scottish History since 1700' (Women's History Scotland, 2020). In addition to this the aforementioned book by Rosemary Goring *'Her Story: The Nation's History by the Women Who Lived It'* (Goring, 2018) provides multiple primary sources both about and from the perspective of historic Scottish women which could be adapted for classroom use. These resources represent only a miniscule fraction of the growing literature and resources on Scottish women both within written and online academia.

Conclusion

Ultimately, whilst Scotland has made significant moves towards gender inclusivity in the history curriculum particularly at senior level, more needs to be done to reach gender balance, especially at BGE level as for many students this will be their only academic experience of history. Currently Scottish women's history in the curriculum suffers from narrow periodisation and having women in separate units rather than fully integrated which could lead to 'othering' women's history from 'normal' history in the minds of students. Pupils should develop a historical consciousness where both genders are valued to challenge discrimination and outdated views on gender and give a well-rounded view of Scotland's past. Scotland's curriculum mandates studying the nation's history, yet so many Scottish heroines are not currently in the narrative. It is the responsibility of educators to utilise the availability of modern resources on women in order to encourage gender balance within the curriculum. The smallest of changes still contributes to this important effort.

References

- Abrams, L. (2011) Women in Scottish History: new directions and possibilities. *History Teaching Review Year Book*, 25(1), p.39-46
- Crocco, M. (1997), Making Time for Women's History...When Your Survey Course is Already Filled to Overflowing. *Social Education*, 61(1), p.32-37.
- Education Scotland (n.d) *Curriculum for Excellence: Social Studies Experiences and Outcomes*. Available: <https://education.gov.scot/Documents/social-studies-eo.pdf> [Accessed: 28th March, 2020]
- Ewan, E. L. & Meikle, M. M. (1998) *Women in Scotland c.1100-c.1750*. Glasgow: Tuckwell Press Ltd
- Goring, R. (2018) *Scotland: Her Story: The Nation's History by the Women Who Lived It*. Edinburgh: Birlinn Ltd.
- Glasgow Women's Library (2020) *Glasgow Women's Library Home Page*. Available: <https://womenslibrary.org.uk/> [Accessed: 10th March, 2020]
- Hughes, B. (2016) Why Were Women Written Out of History? An Interview with Bettany Hughes. *English Heritage*, 29th February. Available: <http://blog.english-heritage.org.uk/women-written-history-interview-bettany-hughes/> [Accessed 22nd November, 2020]
- Johnson, B. (n.d) *Flora MacDonald*. Available: <https://www.historic-uk.com/HistoryUK/HistoryofScotland/Flora-Macdonald/> [Accessed: 10th November, 2020]
- Kent, S. K. (2012) *Gender and History*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Knox, W. (2006) *The Lives of Scottish Women: Women and Scottish Society 1800-1980*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Lerner, G. (1975) Placing Women in History: Definitions and Challenges. *Feminist Studies*, 3(1/2), p.5-14. Available: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3518951> [Accessed: 20th March, 2020]
- Levstik, L. (2009) What Educational Research Says about Learning Women's History. In: Berkin, C., Crocco, M. & Wilson, B. eds. *Clio in the Classroom: A Guide for Teaching U.S. Women's History*. New York: Oxford University Press, p. 281-293.

- Levstik, L. S. & Groth, J. (2002) "Scary Thing, Being An Eighth Grader": Exploring Gender and Sexuality in a Middle School U.S. History Unit. *Theory & Research in Social Education*, 30(2) p. 233-254. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.2002.10473193> [Accessed: 27th November, 2020]
- Lockyer, B. & Tazzymant, A. (2016) 'Victims of history': Challenging students' perceptions of women in history. *Teaching History*, 165(1), p.8-15. Available: <https://www.history.org.uk/publications/resource/9036/victims-of-history-challengingstudents-percep> [Accessed: 20th November, 2020]
- MacIntosh, P. (1983) *Interactive Phases of Curricula Re-Vision: A Feminist Perspective*. Working Paper No. 124. Wellesley : Wellesley College Centre for Research on Women, p.3-35.
- McDermid, J. (2011) No Longer Curiously Rare but Only Just within Bounds: Women in Scottish History. *Women's History Review*, 20(3), p. 389-402. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/09612025.2010.509152> [Accessed: 22nd March, 2020]
- Murphy, C. (1992) Women's History, Feminist History, or Gender History? *The Irish Review* (Cork), 12(1), p. 21-26. Available: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/29735639> [Accessed: 19th March, 2020]
- Noddings, N. (2001) The Care Tradition: Beyond 'Add Women and Stir'. *Theory Into Practice*, 40(1), p.29-34. Available: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1477215> [Accessed: 16th March, 2020]
- Osler, A. (1994) Still Hidden from History? The Representation of Women in Recently Published History Textbooks. *Oxford Review of Education*, 20(2), p. 219-235. Available: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1050624> [Accessed: 27th November, 2020]
- Pearson, J. (2012) Where are we? The place of women in history curricula. *Teaching History*, 147(1), p.47-52. Available: <https://www.history.org.uk/secondary/resource/5579/where-are-we-the-place-of-women-in-history-curric> [Accessed: 16th March, 2020]
- Rowbotham, S. (1973) *Hidden from History: 300 years of women's oppression and the fight against it*. London: Pluto Press
- Scottish Executive (2007) Gender Equality: A Toolkit for Education Staff. Edinburgh: The Scottish Government. Available: <https://www2.gov.scot/resource/doc/196713/0052704.pdf> [Accessed: 1st April, 2020]
- Scottish Qualifications Authority (2019) Higher History Course Specification. Available: https://www.sqa.org.uk/files_ccc/HigherCourseSpecHistory.pdf [Accessed: November 28th, 2020]
- Scottish Qualifications Authority (2019) National 5 History Course Specification. Available: https://www.sqa.org.uk/files_ccc/HistoryCourseSpecN5.pdf [Accessed: November 20th, 2020]
- Smith, J. (2019) Curriculum coherence and teachers' decision making in Scottish high school history syllabi. *The Curriculum Journal*, 30(4), p.441-463. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585176.2019.1647861> [Accessed: 26th November 2020]
- Urquhart, F. (1980) *Proud Lady in a Cage*. Edinburgh: Paul Harris Publishing.
- Woyshner, C. (2002) Political History as Women's History: Toward a More Inclusive Curriculum. *Theory & Research in Social Education*, 30(3), p.354-380. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.2002.10473201> [Accessed: 21st November, 2020]

Recovering Education: History in the Post-Pandemic Classroom

Mamie Philp is a Writer and a History Teacher at Basil Paterson School in Edinburgh

With the cancellation of exams in 2020, the COVID-19 pandemic led to the fiasco in the award of qualifications, not just in Scotland but across the UK. The announcement that National 5 exams would not go ahead in 2021 and teacher assessment will once again form the basis of qualifications provides the opportunity to propose a different approach to the curriculum in schools. The COVID-19 Education Recovery Group set up by the Scottish Government is tasked with ensuring excellence and equity in education as well as providing leadership and coping strategies for the recovery of the education system during and beyond the pandemic. Furthermore, the Group is to be a forum for discussion on proposed improvements and will consider changes to education strategy (Scottish Government, 2020). Now is the time, therefore, to critically review our education system, particularly the number of exams young people sit and the purpose they serve. As teachers of history, we should aim to influence the discussion and propose changes that benefit our subject and the young people that sit in our classrooms. The suggested way forward here is the permanent removal of the National 5 exam which may be considered a radical move but one that would transform the learning and teaching experience of history for us and our pupils.

Why remove the National 5 exam?

Before considering what History could look like in the classroom without the National 5 exam, it is important to briefly make the case for its removal. The most important exams for many young people are Highers because those are the level needed for most university courses and some college courses; the academic route. National 5 is usually the route to taking the Higher and as their teachers, we know our pupils and their abilities best, therefore, we would be able to determine which pupils should continue to Higher History. Indeed, teacher estimates having been used this year to award fair grades to all provides a precedent for the judgement of teachers to be recognised as the key to pupil assessment and recommendations for the next phase: academic or vocational. This will require further thinking about the structure of our education system: removing the National 5 exam could change the structure of schools to extend the Broad General Education (BGE) into S4 and the senior phase to become a two-year programme of exams or vocational studies

delivered through a combination of schools, colleges and work experience/apprenticeships (Philp, 2018).

A benefit of no exam for all in S4 is that the classroom could once again become a place of equality and equity, where pupils are not divided by their ability to sit an exam or not, where Nationals 3 and 4 are too easy, thus demotivating, for so many and where individuals get the required resources based on need. The gap between National 4 and National 5 has been a wide one from the outset but this has become wider as the National 5 exam has become more challenging. Exams are valued as the test of ability, mainly because parents/carers, employers and other stakeholders understand what they are supposed to do and they have strict marking schemes, while Nationals 3 and 4, awarded by assessments not bound by time or recalled knowledge (so-called 'open book'), are valued less, even by the young people doing them. Furthermore, in many classrooms, pupils follow National 5 courses with a lot of content they do not need or are given resources and told to work their way through these while the National 5 course is taught. This is understandable because we are judged primarily on exam results and the future of our subject (and jobs) depend on a successful pass rate as a means of encouraging uptake. Take away the National 5 exam and all pupils become equal and we can ensure equity by giving everyone in our classes the time and resources they need to raise attainment.

The concern whenever change is proposed is that there has been too much change already, we have just got used to the new system, National 5 continues to be updated so we're still getting to grips with all of that and so on. However, why not change something that needs to be improved? Sandra Leaton Gray undertook a research project about schools across the European Union which demonstrated that 'the UK is the only European country to have high-stakes testing at 16, with others adopting a more enlightened approach... Instead, the schools have teacher-moderated assessment and relatively low-stakes internal exams, mainly as a progress check to ensure pupils are on track' (Leaton Gray 2018). She observed that these schools, 'provide a spectacularly broad and balanced education of the kind most UK parents can only dream of' (Leaton Gray 2018). Yet some of our young people have been sitting National 5 exams at the age of 15.

It could be argued that the National 5 exam is driven by the ability to remember things; firstly, the content of the topics, secondly, the rigid processes by which to answer the questions. As O'Hanlon says this has led to the teaching of topics to be driven by practising exam questions over and over again which, although it 'can improve exam technique, it is unlikely to result in pupils getting better at history' (O'Hanlon, 2018). We have been constrained by inflexible marking schemes which allow very little scope for professional judgement, examining the reliability of answering questions over the validity of how young people handle historical material. The fact that we are judged on exam results, that SQA marking schemes are so prescriptive and we operate within time constraints means that we often 'teach to the test'. This can lead to valuing what is measured rather than measuring what is valuable. Yet 'passing an exam and being good at history are two entirely separate objectives'. It is increasing the historical understanding of pupils that will increase their ability to perform at a higher level (O'Hanlon, 2018).

There is general consensus that teaching generic skills does not make for good history education. Learning skills through repeated practice and repeating the same types of questions does not lead to pupils grasping concepts (Lee, 2010). Counsell goes further in saying that an obsession with assessments that are skills based and adherence to strict marking schemes takes the joy out of learning history and is not effective in history education (Counsell, 2018). Wineburg's view supports this: 'relying on generic skills ... offers precious little about students' ability to read and think historically' (quoted in Lévesque and Clark, 2018).

Developing a revised curriculum

If we are to remove the National 5 exam, then something has to replace it in terms of what we teach, how we teach it and how we assess learning. Nationals 3 and 4 would also be removed so that all young people would have the opportunities to achieve individual potential through the same route of progression.

Assessment in the BGE from S1 through to S4 should be meaningful whether a school takes the approach of all pupils studying the subject into S4 or retaining an element of choice after S2 or S3. From S1 pupils would be working towards gaining a History credit on their education certificate. If they do not opt for History after S2 or S3 (depending on your school's arrangements) then they can be credited with whatever they have achieved by that stage. In that way, everything they do from S1 counts towards their certificate. Those that choose History into S4 will continue to work towards achieving the best level they can and demonstrate suitability for Higher as appropriate.

Extending the BGE into S4 means we could look again at what we teach. The replacement of strict exam content by a system where teachers and pupils can have flexibility in the choice of topics to be studied would allow teachers to 'be creative, design lessons appropriate to the young people they have in the classroom and not be constrained by exam syllabi' (Philp, 2018).

The structure of the BGE decided in schools, however, may retain existing issues in terms of subject choice and history as part of social subjects. Worldwide history has become part of 'social studies' or 'social subjects' (Lévesque and Clark, 2018) and Lee, among others, has commented that this has made it easy for history to 'lose its sense of purpose' (Lee, 2010). Smith makes the point that 'we must understand the 'unique disciplinary contribution' of history. While social subjects have much in common history has a distinct identity that those who lived in the past can no longer speak for themselves' (Smith, 2016). Whether history regains its place as a discrete subject or retains a role within social subjects we must take this opportunity to design a history curriculum that reflects the uniqueness of the subject and even have the word 'history' replacing 'People, Past Events and Societies'; recognising the discipline that is history.

The most important thing is what we teach and making it meaningful. This goes to the heart of what history education is about and why we teach the subject in schools in the first place. There is an opportunity to create courses that sit coherently within social studies, if that remained the case, while demonstrating the unique value that only history brings: the framework of the past to make sense of the present and make decisions about the future, which is discussed in more depth below. The BGE should have two key aims: providing a framework for young people who do not continue with history to view the world and preparing those who

choose to study history further with a rigorous set of tools to do so. The focus needs to be enabling young people to get better at history, allowing scope for progression.

Progression via extending the BGE using the Experiences and Outcomes

One approach would be to extend what we are already doing in terms of the Experiences and Outcomes (E&Os) and associated benchmarks. The BGE already gives us the freedom to adapt our courses as circumstances and needs change, supposedly designed to allow for achievement of different levels at different stages. 'Learning is usually not linear and learners may progress along different routes and pathways through the experiences and outcomes. It will take time to progress from secure learning within one level to the next' (Education Scotland, 2011). In terms of assessment the benchmarks could be a starting point given that we are supposed to use them to 'plan periodic, holistic assessment of children's and young people's learning' while avoiding 'undue focus on individual Benchmarks which may result in over-assessing or recording of learners' progress' (Education Scotland, 2020).

However, this is fraught with difficulty and does not make for meaningful assessment. Smith clearly outlines some of the problems with the E&Os including the use of 'I can' statements, the scope for misunderstanding terminology such as identity, empathy, evidence, the inherent tick box approach to progression and the confusion between substantive knowledge and second order concepts (which are given a low status) (Smith, 2016). Smith's conclusion is that the E&Os are at the same time overly simplistic and overly complex. Although the E&Os were not intended to be progressive in a linear way, they have tended to be adopted as such in practice, for example, where some schools have instructed that pupils could not have 'achieved' beyond a certain level by the end of S1 to allow for recording of progression at the end of S2. The benchmarks were supposed to clarify the issue of the broadness of the E&Os, to provide a framework for assessment, yet they adopt an exam style numerical approach which does not necessarily mean that pupils are getting better at history.

Progression focused on procedural knowledge

Getting history education 'right' in schools is vital not just because a lot of children give up history at the end of S2 after an average of only an hour per week but also because learning does not stop in school. We learn outside of school as children and continue to do so as adults. History is available from various media, parents/carers, friends and so on and Lee asserts that 'awareness of the past and the claims we make about it come in many forms', and is used by some for their own purposes. Therefore, history education in schools should ensure young people are 'better able to understand the past than they could otherwise have done' (Lee, 2010).

Stearns opines that 'a well-trained student of history' learns how to assess evidence and conflicting interpretations as well as gain 'an essential skill in what we are regularly told is our 'ever-changing world' (Stearns, 1998). This is a view that remains relevant and shared by others. Lévesque and Clark discuss history education as a means to transform 'the way pupils see the world' (Lévesque and Clark, 2018). Lee agrees that seeing the world through history is important but that

it is more than about recalled knowledge, there must be understanding and learning of new concepts. History 'must make a difference to intellectual behaviour'. He discusses the importance of producing the 'best possible arguments' that have validity, truth, respect for evidence, acceptance of different stories, respect for people in the past, and link the past to the present and the future (Lee, 2010). Historical consciousness is the 'interpretation of the past that allows an understanding of the present and the consideration of the future' Duquette (2015, p. 53). Historical thinking and historical consciousness are different pedagogical traditions in historical education but both express the importance for history to be usable in the present and both distinguish between substantive knowledge (content) and second order concepts or procedural knowledge which underpins and transcends content.

As a course of study, a curriculum should have 'content structured as a narrative' where 'every bit of content has a function'. Counsell talks about the idea of a 'hinterland' of knowledge which supports 'core' knowledge. The hinterland might include vocabulary and terminology which become locked in long term memory that is accessed whenever pupils come across it. She refers to layers of knowledge and prior knowledge which pupils build up over time and which they draw on to make progress in a subject (Counsell, 2018). Clearly knowledge is important, yet, according to Lévesque and Clark (2018), 'few teachers consider knowledge when planning'. Smith did a survey of twenty-one schools where he asked the reasons for the content chosen to teach the BGE. Popular reasons included the selection of topics which pupils might find exciting in order to encourage uptake because uptake equals job security. Even where integrated social subjects were taught successfully in S1, the competition for options, and resulting rivalry for recruits, became apparent in S2. Another common reason was preparation for the senior phase (Smith, 2019). All of these reasons we recognise and are understandable, but, when we consider the importance of historical education, they are not good enough. Choosing content should go hand in hand with facilitating pupils becoming better at history and emphasising the uniqueness of our subject. That also involves moving away from the 'generic skills' approach discussed above.

Substantive knowledge

First, there has to be substantive knowledge, the content. This should paint a picture of the past and be usable (Lee, 2010). It is the core knowledge which is to be recalled (Counsell, 2018) and what history is about. More than any other subject, knowledge selection is a dilemma in history given its vastness. How do we decide what to teach? No wonder we resort to 'what will they find engaging to make sure we have the numbers next year'. We could focus on substantive concepts such as 'empire', 'nation', 'factory', 'colonialism', 'Reformation', 'industrialisation'. Then we have to consider what time periods we cover in the time available. Do we go for a broad sweep, or an in-depth study? No wonder that the BGE is often watered-down versions of exam syllabi (Smith, 2019). Referring to the research of Kate Hammond in 2014, whatever the topic, pupils with 'good knowledge' should be able to use knowledge to demonstrate understanding such as referring to the broader context of an event, be able to work with layers of knowledge: previous learning that brings deeper understanding to what is being

currently studied and be able to 'switch between historical frames when appropriate' (Ford, accessed 2020).

Whatever content we decide should go hand in hand with second order concepts, also referred to as procedural knowledge. Pupils can learn content but it is procedural knowledge that leads to progression in history and that progression can be demonstrated and recorded (Lévesque and Clark, 2018). Ford comments on Counsell's research that 'to deepen their understanding of history there needs to be interplay of historical knowledge and conceptual understanding' (Ford, accessed 2020).

Content

Without the constraints of exam syllabi topics could be chosen by the teacher or in discussion with pupils. A list could be compiled through consultation because it would remain important to include breadth of topics in keeping with Curriculum for Excellence (CfE) principles and share resources. Again, we can start from what we already teach in the BGE and for the Nationals; we just don't need to be constrained by the SQA topics nor teach every bit of a topic. Current topics may well remain as optional elements in whole or parts, for example, a comparison of the impact of the First World War in Scotland and Russia, a comparison of the 1930s in Germany, Russia and the USA reflecting differing political systems and the response of each country to the Great Depression. Both of these examples could adapt existing resources from current courses. Furthermore, there would be flexibility to make history responsive to current events, for example, with regards to the Black Lives Matter campaign, we could focus attention on the history of civil rights in Scotland and the UK. Or maybe adapt the Atlantic Slave Trade unit to focus less on the benefits brought to Britain by the trade and more on the consequences of the trade with reference to racism, the debate over statues and so on. Such an approach would also fit with social subjects, for example, linking political systems to Modern Studies, the study of the geography of the Holocaust, both human and landscape. At the same time, young people are learning substantive history and the procedures involved in studying evidence.

Keeping current topics and agreeing any new ones would make sense in terms of using the resources we already have especially if money has been spent on textbooks and publishers requiring to know what we teach in order to produce textbooks to make profits. That said, the pandemic led to publishers making textbooks available online and it may be that how we access books could change in line with technology such as books being available online by chapter. The important thing would be for publishers to ensure that any textbook gets it right this time: when the Nationals were implemented most were written as National 4/5 textbooks which missed the point that these are different courses.

Procedural knowledge

Procedural knowledge is essential to understanding history (Lee, 2010). Where substantive knowledge is the 'know what', procedural knowledge is to 'know how'. It is about assessing the validity of accounts of the past and being able to produce accounts that are more valid. It is about providing a framework for critical analysis and understanding how knowledge of history is put together (Smith,

2016). Procedural knowledge shapes the way historians ‘do’ history and must not be confused with skills (Lévesque and Clark, 2018). Smith opines that children can be inducted and develop procedural concepts (Smith, 2016) while O’Hanlon concludes that pupils rarely improve written responses without the understanding of procedural concepts. It leads them to perform better in exams by increasing their awareness of what they have been asked to do (O’Hanlon, 2018). Given the evidence, it makes sense that we use procedural knowledge as the basis for assessing progression in history.

The Historical Association (accessed 2020) organises procedural knowledge into the headings that follow.

Cause and consequence

The ability to identify short- and long-term causes of events and the resulting impacts which might take years to be felt. The need to establish ‘layers of cause’ and the ‘ripples afterwards’ so that we can reach understandings useful to the present, look for lessons to learn from and consider how historical narratives can be used in society (Lévesque and Clark, 2018).

There are a number of ‘key strands’ which need to be understood; there are multiple causes of events that can lead to varying consequences, that causes should be prioritised in terms of how much of an influence each one had, that there are underlying causes: the conditions that affect what people do and that there can be unintended consequences because people cannot predict the consequences of their actions (Ford, accessed 2020).

Continuity and change

Lévesque and Clark identify continuity and change as one of the benchmarks established by Seixas in 2006, the ‘problem’ being how changes and continuities are interwoven (Lévesque and Clark, 2018). Lee argues that ‘assumptions about change can make history either unintelligible or useless’, citing the responses of two pupils to the question, ‘would history help in deciding how to deal with race relations?’. One said yes, the other no. The pupil who said no interpreted changes as localised events or actions over a short period of time while the pupil who said yes understood that change is a process, therefore being able to see ‘the present as the moving face of the past’. Change should relate the past to the present and is part of the ‘conceptual apparatus’ needed to understand history (Lee, 2010).

The process of continuity and change should enable, for example, the understanding that past societies are not fixed, that chronologies can be used to show how they are interwoven over time, that change can vary over time in terms of flow, pace, extent and turning points, that change and continuity are not a single process (Ford, accessed 2020).

Similarity & difference

Ford refers to this as ‘historical perspectives’ to reflect that what is essential is to try to ‘see the past on its own terms’. History should not be interpreted through the prism of present-day values and concepts; it is important to think about the thoughts and feelings of people in the past and not imagine the past based on modern world views (Ford accessed 2020). The Historical Association cites that

the concept of similarity and difference is ‘to move beyond stereotypical assumptions about people in the past, to recognise and analyse the diversity of past experience...between different sorts of people – and between people within the same group’ (The Historical Association, accessed 2020). Ford also recognises the diversity of experiences of people in the past and concludes that ‘understanding diversity is key to understanding history’ (Ford accessed 2020).

There is also the notion of historical empathy, ‘understanding why people in the past thought and acted as they did’ and empathy as caring, ‘the emotional connections and interests necessary to care about and for history’ Lévesque and Clark, 2018).

Significance

When we select the topics to teach, we are already deciding what is significant. When we do so, we might think about the narrative, the historical questions: what is worth learning about? The decision to select certain events over others might include profundity, quantity, durability, relevance, intimate interest, symbolic significance, contemporary relevance or identification (the association with specific people and events in history) (Lévesque and Clark, 2018). Ford talks about significance as provisional because it can vary over time and criteria are needed to judge it (Ford, accessed 2020). As procedural knowledge, pupils should be able to explain why a certain event or person from history is significant at any given time. They might consider, for example, what was new about an event in the past, apply its significance to the present, think about why certain events are remembered and the impact of an event (History Skills, accessed 2020).

Lévesque and Clark raise the ethical dimension: how can we judge people in the past? When and how do crimes and sacrifices bear consequence today? What obligations do we have? Our moral response can be directed to a variety of ends such as remembrance, condemnation, admiration, activism (Lévesque and Clark, 2018). This affects not only decisions on what is significant to teach but also what is considered significant beyond the school subject that is history.

Evidence

‘Without evidence, there is of course no history to speak of, only speculation’ (Ford, accessed 2020). Working with evidence is complex and it is crucial to get it right. The strands identified by Ford include drawing inferences from primary sources to create interpretations, that evidence must be cross-referenced, that the utility of evidence depends on the question, that author, audience and purpose should be considered before the source is read and it must be understood within the context of the time. Lévesque and Clark refer to these as the problem of evidence: how do we know things and use evidence to support claims? Looking at source type, the context of sources, comparing sources is needed as well as asking meaningful questions, evaluating and reaching conclusions (Lévesque and Clark, 2018). Lee draws attention to the need to respect evidence and that it is disastrous to consider such as bias or reliability as fixed attributes (Lee, 2010). There must be competent and ethical use of source material yet CfE does not currently appreciate the distinction between ‘source’ and ‘evidence’ (Smith, 2016).

Interpretations

'Every piece of historical writing is an interpretation of some sort. The past is not fixed but constructed through interpretations' (Ford, accessed 2020). However, these interpretations can differ; historians can work on the same issue at different times and places yet reach different conclusions which are equally valid (Lipscomb, 2016). Lévesque and Clark relate interpretations to providing insight into our own lives, giving guidance to contemporary actions, forming perspectives and displaying information about the past (Lévesque and Clark, 2018).

Interpretations are constructs of the past which should go beyond labelling as primary or secondary sources, a notion that is open to confusion. Just because someone was alive when an event occurred does not make them an eyewitness to it and does not make an interpretation more 'useful'. Too often pupils say that secondary sources are not useful because the author was not there. This does not reflect the complexity of interpretations. The Historical Association (2019) proposes that secondary sources require a different set of questions and a special kind of attention. The related article and Card cite the work of McAleavy who 'emphasised the value of looking at real interpretations, chronologically distant from the period under study, so that pupils could see how an event and its significance are refracted through the shifting values and priorities of time' (Card, 2004).

The Historical Association (2019) further explains that interpretations are always created for a reason and in a particular context. There needs to be a clear sense of who created (the) interpretation, in what circumstances, and for what purpose. A common mistake is to ask pupils to only reach a judgement about accuracy or truthfulness. Furthermore, it is not enough to briefly summarise the argument of the chosen historian or other interpreter. Pupils should build knowledge about the interpretation itself, the period of the interpreter and the period being interpreted. They should be introduced to the sheer range of interpretations. If they see how interpretations or particular types of interpretation change over time, they start to understand more of the complexity of factors that can shape interpretations. History should give pupils the opportunity to study the interpretations of others, which is what it is, and to construct their own interpretations of the past.

Progression

Counsell suggests that procedural knowledge makes substantive knowledge possible (Counsell, 2016). Progression, therefore, must be based on procedural knowledge. As teachers of history, we know about procedural knowledge yet have found ourselves in a system driven by content and generic skills which might enable pupils to do exams but have not made them better at history. The BGE has often focused on how we engage pupils to want to take our subject rather than providing the tools to view the world should they not do so. Yet it is clear that to have layers of substantive knowledge built up over time underpinned by procedural knowledge provides the foundation and framework not only for progression in history but also for future learning outside of the history classroom and successful exam performance within it.

Progression models can be constructed for some procedural knowledge and Ford has done a piece of research which brings together the work of Scott (1990), Morton and Seixas (2012), Blow (2011), Foster (2013), Lee and Shemilt (2003, 2004), Wineburg (1999, 2007), Counsell (2004), Phillips (2002) to suggest models of progression (Ford, accessed 2020). Byrom also did research on this related to the 2014 National Curriculum in England (accessed 2020).

It is important to note that progression in different aspects of procedural knowledge will happen at different rates. They do not increase in tandem with each other (Lévesque and Clark, 2018). Progression is also not linked to age; research conducted by the Concepts of History and Teaching Approaches 7-14 (CHATA) project revealed the notion of the 'seven-year gap'; some seven-year olds thought like fourteen-year olds and vice versa (Lévesque and Clark, 2018). O'Hanlon's reading has shown that teaching is essential to historical understanding, and not age (O'Hanlon, 2018).

Note also that 'progression' is different to 'progress'. Pupils can make progress in, for example, note-taking, essay writing, giving presentations and recalling information. This relates to 'the aggregationist assumptions that seem to be implicit in examinations, widespread among curriculum managers in schools and enshrined in classroom practice'. Progression, on the other hand, is about 'the way in which pupils' ideas – about history and about the past – develop' and has to 'show some structure in the way children's ideas change' (Lee and Shemilt, 2003). Working on procedural knowledge does not simply add to information about the past but enables understanding of the discipline of history. For example, a progression model for cause and consequence may begin with the idea that there is a single cause for what has happened in the past. That things in the past happened because of the actions/plans of a particular person or group and that consequences were unintended. Progression through various stages may lead to understanding that there are multiple short-term and long-term causes of events to be assessed. Relationships between causes are recognised and historical change is explained through the interplay of actions and underlying as social, political, economic, religious or military conditions. A differentiation is made between the intended and unintended consequences of actions (Ford, accessed 2020).

Taking into account various draft models and research (as discussed above), progression in cause and consequence may look something like this:

Progression in ideas about Cause and Consequence

Sole Reasons

Pupils believe there is a single cause for what has happened in the past. Things in the past happened because of the actions/plans of a particular person or group. Consequences were unintended.

Multiple Reasons

Pupils recognise that there are multiple causes for what happened in the past. Why things happened might be questioned and explanations offered. Consequences were incidental.

Motivations

Pupils recognise why people did certain things and that consequences may have been intended. They identify the causes and results of historical events, situations or changes.

Impacts

Pupils recognise that actions and events have an impact on the lives of people at the time and on the lives of people after the time. These may be planned or unintended. Effects can be immediate, short term or long term.

Prioritisation

Reasons for historical events are discussed in terms of relative importance. Different causes are ranked by their influence. The consequences at the time of an event and after the time of an event are assessed in terms of importance.

Cause and Consequence in Contexts

Multiple short-term and long-term causes of events are assessed. Relationships between causes are recognised. Historical change is explained through the interplay of actions and the underlying conditions, for example, social, political, economic, religious or military conditions. A differentiation is made between the intended and unintended consequences of actions.

More detailed examples of progression in ideas about evidence and progression in ideas about historical accounts have been provided by Lee and Shemilt (2003, 2004), the former briefly summarised below:

Progression in ideas about evidence
Pictures of the past The past is viewed as the present. Stories are just stories.
Information The past is fixed. Sources provide information that is either correct or incorrect.
Testimony The past is reported by people living at the time; this is done well or badly. History has a methodology for testing statements. Notions of bias, exaggeration and missing information supplement the idea of truth or lies. Conflicts in potential evidence are decided by which report is best.
Scissors and paste We can put together a version of the past by picking out true statements from different reports and putting them together, taking account of whether the reporter is in a position to know.
Evidence in isolation Statements about the past can be inferred from sources of evidence. Historians may work out historical facts even if no testimony survives. The weight we give any piece of evidence depends on the questions we ask of it.
Evidence in context A source only provides evidence when understood in its historical context. This includes provisional acceptance of much historical work as established fact. A sense of period is important.

Recording and reporting attainment

There remains the issue of recording progress and attainment. That usually means being able to allocate some form of mark, level or grade so that we can provide evidence for our decisions and provide reports for senior management, parents/carers and other stakeholders.

The progression models suggested are research based and would be used to ‘pick out the main features of progression over the long term’. Essentially, they could provide the comments in our reports to reflect that Pupil A has made a secure transition to (whatever level) in understanding evidence but understanding of cause remains at (whatever level). These would sit alongside the methods of assessment we use for units of work where shorter-term achievable objectives are needed (Lee and Shemilt, 2003).

Conclusion

The removal of the National 5 exam in 2020 and 2021 provides us with the opportunity to discuss and influence the teaching and learning of history in our classrooms in the future. It is suggested that the National 5 exam be removed permanently and replaced with a system that provides equality and equity for all young people in our classrooms. We would focus more on procedural knowledge which is essential to understanding history rather than being overly focused on teaching to an exam. Progression in procedural knowledge concepts recognises

the uniqueness of our subject and leads to pupils becoming 'better' at the discipline of history. This, in turn, will provide them with the tools to study history at a higher level during their school career, at university, or in the future should they return as adult learners. Understanding procedural knowledge also provides a prism for those who do not study history after the BGE phase to formulate informed views about the past rather than accepting ideas that can be presented through a variety of media and influencers.

Contact: mamiephilp@gmail.com

Website: www.mamiephilp.co.uk

References

- Byrom, J. (no date). Progression in history under the 2014 National Curriculum, A guide for schools. Available at https://www.exeter.ac.uk/media/universityofexeter/collegeofsocialsciencesandinternationalstudies/education/pgce/pre-coursedocuments/pre-coursedocuments2018-19/Progression_in_History_under_the_2014_National_Curriculum.pdf. (Accessed 4/10/20)
- Card, J. (2004). Seeing double: how one period visualises another. In: *Teaching History 117*. The Historical Association, pp. 6-7
- Counsell, C. (2016). Genericism's children. Available at <https://thedignityofthethingblog.wordpress.com/author/christinecounsell/>. (Accessed: 4/10/20)
- Counsell, C. (2018). In search of senior curriculum leadership: Introduction – a dangerous absence. Available at <https://thedignityofthethingblog.wordpress.com/author/christinecounsell/>. (Accessed: 4/10/20)
- Counsell, C. (2018). Senior Curriculum Leadership 1: The indirect manifestation of knowledge: (A) curriculum as narrative. Available at <https://thedignityofthethingblog.wordpress.com/author/christinecounsell/>. (Accessed: 4/10/20)
- Counsell, C. (2018). Senior Curriculum Leadership 1: The indirect manifestation of knowledge: (B) final performance as deceiver and guide. Available at <https://thedignityofthethingblog.wordpress.com/author/christinecounsell/>. (Accessed: 4/10/20)
- Duquette, C., 2015. Relating Historical Consciousness to historical thinking through assessment. In: *New Directions in Historical Thinking*. New York: Routledge, pp. 51-63.
- Education Scotland (2011) Building the Curriculum 5. Available at [Building the Curriculum | Curriculum for Excellence | Policy drivers | Policy for Scottish education | Scottish education system | Education Scotland](#). (Accessed 19 September 2020).
- Education Scotland. (2020) 'Curriculum for Excellence: Social Studies Experiences and Outcomes', updated June 2020. Available at URL <https://education.gov.scot/Documents/social-studies-ec.pdf> (Accessed 19 September 2020)
- Ford, A. (no date). A Suggested Model for Assessment. available at http://www.andallthat.co.uk/uploads/2/3/8/9/2389220/progression_model_for_history.pdf (Accessed 9/10/20)
- History Skills, (no date). Historical Knowledge: Causes and Consequences. Available at <https://www.historyskills.com/historical-knowledge/causes-and-consequences>. (Accessed 4/10/20)
- Leaton Gray, S. (2018) 'No other European country tests children at 16: let's scrap pointless GCSEs', The Guardian, 21 August 2018. Available at <https://www.theguardian.com/education/2018/aug/21/no-other-european-country-tests-at-16-scrap-gcses> (Accessed 17 September 2020)
- Lee, P. (2010) History education and historical literacy in *Debates in History Teaching*. London, Routledge, Chapter 5, pp 63-70

- Lee, P. & Shemilt, D., (2003). A scaffold, not a cage: progression and progression models in history. In: *Teaching History* 113. The Historical Association, pp. 13-23.
- Lee, P. & Shemilt, D., (2004). Progression in understanding about historical accounts. In: *Teaching History* 117. The Historical Association, pp. 25-31.
- Lévesque, S. & Clark, P (2018). Historical thinking: Definitions and educational applications in *Wiley international handbook of history teaching and learning*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell, pp. 119-148
- Lipscomb, S. (2016). A Question of Interpretation in [History Today Volume 66 Issue 2](https://www.historytoday.com/question-interpretation). Available at <https://www.historytoday.com/question-interpretation> (Accessed 4/10/20)
- O'Hanlon, Chris. (2018) The Challenge of Performativity in the Certificated History Classroom in *The Yearbook of the Scottish Association of Teachers of History*
- Philp, M. (2018). *Young People at the Heart of Education, Making Curriculum for Excellence Work*: Amazon.
- Scottish Government. (2020) COVID-19 – 19 Education Recovery Group. Available at URL <https://www.gov.scot/groups/covid-19-education-recovery-group/> (Accessed: 17 September 2020)
- Smith, J (2016): What remains of history? Historical epistemology and historical understanding in Scotland's Curriculum for Excellence, *The Curriculum Journal*, DOI: 10.1080/09585176.2016.1197138
- Smith, J (2019): Curriculum coherence and teachers' decision-making in Scottish high school history syllabi, *The Curriculum Journal*
- Stearns, P.N. (1998) American Historical Association. Available at [https://www.historians.org/about-aha-and-membership/aha-history-and-archives/historical-archives/why-study-history-\(1998\)](https://www.historians.org/about-aha-and-membership/aha-history-and-archives/historical-archives/why-study-history-(1998)) (Accessed: 17 September 2020)
- The Historical Association, (no date). Disciplinary concepts. Available at <https://www.history.org.uk/secondary/categories/pp-disciplinary-concepts> (Accessed 4/10/20)
- The Historical Association. (2019). Interpretations of the past. In: *Teaching History* 177, pp. 23-27.

Writing for the SATH Yearbook

What we are looking for

We have two main criteria for publication: originality and relevance.

We choose to define 'original' broadly, meaning differing from what is already available to teachers. Examples of originality might be:

- An original teaching approach that you have developed in your school
- A local history case study which challenges/ illuminates current subject debates
- A literature review/ synthesis of recent scholarship.
- A piece of research emerging from an ITE/ Masters degree.

'Relevance' means relevant to a history and Social Studies teacher practising in Scotland. Therefore, you should ask how your article can make clear its contribution to developing practice in Scotland's classrooms. For example, as well as discussing what you did, you should take time to explain what other teachers might learn from this (and how they might avoid any mistakes you made!).

- Articles looking at interdisciplinary social studies teaching are welcome, as long as these include an element of historical learning.
- Articles unrelated to history/ social studies, and focusing on other aspects of teaching (e.g. behaviour) are not within the scope of the journal.

Audience

Our primary audience is schoolteachers in Scotland who have a generalised knowledge of most aspects of history. Articles should therefore adopt a scholarly style aimed at intelligent non-experts. Where technical terms are used, you should consider whether these are unavoidable and offer a definition/ explanation.

Format

- Articles will normally be between 2000 and 3500 words. Though we will consider longer submissions and shorter notes, replies or provocations.
- It may help to use references/ citations to demonstrate the originality or value of your work. However, not all articles will need to do this. The format of your article will be determined by its aims and scope

- Use in-text citations throughout. Harvard referencing should be used for cited works.

Illustrations

The journal will be published in Black and White. You may include pictures where these are essential to your argument, but you should not include these simply for decoration. Please see notes on consent below.

Please note

- Consider copyright and consent issues. No material should be reproduced from already published work (either your own or other people's).
- Informed written consent must be gained for photographs or examples of pupils' work. You should not identify any pupils by name, though identifying your own school is permissible, once headteacher approval has been secured. Any material which does not meet these criteria will be removed before publication.

How to submit

Submissions meeting the above criteria can be emailed to Joe Smith at The University of Stirling: joseph.smith@stir.ac.uk

The editorial process

- You can submit either a full article or an idea for an article to the email address above.
- You will normally receive an acknowledgement of your submission within 48 hours. If you have submitted an outline idea for an article, you will receive feedback on whether this idea is relevant to the aims of the journal.
- Within 10 working days you will receive detailed feedback on your article, possibly with suggestions for improvement.
- You will have as much time as you need to work on these suggestions and will be fully supported throughout the re-drafting process.
- All relevant submissions will be accepted into the Yearbook after this re-drafting process is complete.
- You will receive notification that your final version has been accepted.
- The Yearbook is compiled in November each year. Articles not finalised by this deadline will appear in the next year's edition.